REVIEW ARTICLE

Contributions of anterior cingulate cortex to behaviour

Orrin Devinsky,¹ Martha J. Morrell,² and Brent A. Vogt³

¹Department of Neurology, New York University School of Medicine, New York, the ²Department of Neurology and Neurological Sciences, Stanford University School of Medicine, Stanford and the ³Department of Physiology and Pharmacology Bowman Gray School of Medicine, Wake Forest University, Medical Center Boulevard, Winston-Salem, USA Correspondence to: Orrin Devinsky, MD, Department of Neurology, Hospital for Joint Diseases, 301 East 17th Street, New York, NY 10003, USA

Summary

Assessments of anterior cingulate cortex in experimental animals and humans have led to unifying theories of its structural organization and contributions to mammalian behaviour. The anterior cingulate cortex forms a large region around the rostrum of the corpus callosum that is termed the anterior executive region. This region has numerous projections into motor systems, however, since these projections originate from different parts of anterior cingulate cortex and because functional studies have shown that it does not have a uniform contribution to brain functions, the anterior executive region is further subdivided into 'affect' and 'cognition' components. The affect division includes areas 25, 33 and rostral area 24, and has extensive connections with the amygdala and periaqueductal grey, and parts of it project to autonomic brainstem motor nuclei. In addition to regulating autonomic and endocrine functions, it is involved in conditioned emotional learning, vocalizations associated with expressing internal states, assessments of motivational content and assigning emotional valence to internal and external stimuli, and maternal-infant interactions. The cognition division includes caudal areas 24' and 32', the cingulate motor areas in the cingulate sulcus and nociceptive cortex. The cingulate motor areas project to the spinal cord and red nucleus and have premotor functions, while the nociceptive area is engaged in both response selection and cognitively demanding information processing. The cingulate epilepsy syndrome provides important support of experimental animal and human functional imaging studies for the role of anterior cingulate cortex in movement, affect and social behaviours. Excessive

cingulate activity in cases with seizures confirmed in anterior cingulate cortex with subdural electrode recordings, can impair consciousness, alter affective state and expression, and influence skeletomotor and autonomic activity. Interictally, patients with anterior cingulate cortex epilepsy often display psychopathic or sociopathic behaviours. In other clinical examples of elevated anterior cingulate cortex activity it may contribute to tics, obsessive-compulsive behaviours, and aberrent social behaviour. Conversely, reduced cingulate activity following infarcts or surgery can contribute to behavioural disorders including akinetic mutism, diminished self-awareness and depression, motor neglect and impaired motor initiation, reduced responses to pain, and aberrent social behaviour. The role of anterior cingulate cortex in pain responsiveness is suggested by cingulumotomy results and functional imaging studies during noxious somatic stimulation. The affect division of anterior cingulate cortex modulates autonomic activity and internal emotional responses, while the cognition division is engaged in response selection associated with skeletomotor activity and responses to noxious stimuli. Overall, anterior cingulate cortex appears to play a crucial role in initiation, motivation, and goal-directed behaviours. The anterior cingulate cortex is part of a larger matrix of structures that are engaged in similar functions. These structures form the rostral limbic system and include the amygdala, periaqueductal grey, ventral striatum, orbitofrontal and anterior insular cortices. The system formed by these interconnected areas assesses the motivational content of internal and external stimuli and regulates context-dependent behaviours.

Keywords: limbic system; premotor function; epilepsy; visceromotor control; affect; cognition; nociception; akinetic mutism; schizophrenia

Introduction

Cingulate cortex is one of the largest parts of the limbic lobe (Broca, 1878) and the limbic system (MacLean, 1990). Early theories viewed the entire cingulate gyrus as being involved in emotion. Recent experiments, however, have shown that the anterior part of the cingulate gyrus plays a role in emotion and motor functions, and that the posterior region is involved in visuospatial and memory functions with little or no involvement in affect. Although anterior cingulate cortex has prominent projections to motor systems, its contributions to human behaviour have been elusive because isolated cingulate lesions are rare and surgical interventions in the interhemispheric space are infrequent. Spontaneous lesions of anterior cingulate cortex, such as tumours and strokes, almost always involve adjacent areas, such as mesial frontal cortex, white matter and the septum. Stroke and epilepsy rarely provide examples of isolated cingulate dysfunction.

The mixed involvement of cingulate and adjacent cortices in stroke is due to the distribution of the anterior cerebral artery. The anterior cerebral artery has eight branches which, in addition to supplying cingulate cortex, distribute to the medial portions of the orbital gyri, the entire medial aspect of the anterior two-thirds of the cerebral hemispheres including the supplementary motor area, and through the recurrent artery of Huebner, the head of the caudate nucleus, anterior putamen, and the anterior limb of the internal capsule (Marino, 1976; Perlmutter and Rhoton, 1978). Thus, a selective occlusion of one of the cortical branches does not usually give rise to an isolated cingulate infarct. Further, the cingulate gyri are deep in the interhemispheric fissure and selective disruption during a seizure cannot be confirmed without invasive electrodes. In light of its complicated vascularization and anatomical inaccessibility, PET studies and selective cortical ablations are the most useful approaches to characterizing functions subserved by human anterior cingulate cortex.

This review considers the 'executive functions' of anterior cingulate cortex including its interactions with motor systems, its role in response selection and cognitive processing, and behaviours which involve affect. First, we briefly review the organization and functions of anterior cingulate cortex in experimental animals because they are relevant to interpreting human findings and because so much is known about anterior cingulate cortex connections in non-human primates. The human anterior cingulate cortex surface features and cytoarchitecture is then discussed. Information about its function in human brain is derived from lesions, electrical stimulation, and PET studies. Pre- and post-operative observations of patients with epilepsy provide particularly strong support for the contributions of anterior cingulate cortex to motor function and affective behaviours. Therefore, in addition to a review of previously reported cases, two new epilepsy cases are presented with invasive electrode confirmation of cingulate seizure foci. Other movement disorders that may result from a significant disruption of cingulate function are assessed and include akinetic mutism and Gilles de la Tourette syndrome. The wealth of structural and functional information available for anterior cingulate cortex and its numerous links with motor systems makes this cortical region a rich site for behavioural neurological studies.

Anterior cingulate structure and function in experimental animals

Organization and projections to motor systems The anterior cingulate cortex lies ventral, rostral and dorsal to the corpus callosum, and it has particularly large layer V pyramidal neurons that project into motor systems. Although parts of anterior cingulate cortex play a role in motor function which is similar to premotor and supplementary motor area cortices, anterior cingulate cortex also modulates autonomic activity associated with affective behaviours and response selection (*see* below). One of the unique features of anterior cingulate cortex circuity is its diverse thalamic afferents and consequent ability to sample inputs from more thalamic nuclei than any other cortical region. The ability to sample from a wide range of thalamic inputs may be crucial for its contributions to motor response selection functions.

These thalamocortical projections have recently been summarized in the broader context of thalamic connections of the cingulate gyrus by Bentivoglio et al. (1993). The thalamic nuclei which project to anterior cingulate cortex include projections from the anteromedial, paraventricular, parataenial, paracentral, central and centrolateral, reuniens, parafascicular, limitans, mediodorsal, and ventral anterior nuclei. Although the roles of each of these nuclei in brain functions are not known, it is possible, for example, that the midline and intralaminar thalamic nuclei transmit information relating to nociception (Casey, 1966; Dong et al., 1978; Sikes and Vogt, 1992) and eye movements (Schlag-Rey and Schlag, 1984). Such thalamic activity could drive responses in human anterior cingulate cortex associated with nociceptive stimuli (Jones et al., 1991a) and eye movement activity (Petit et al., 1993). Thus, when considering the unique contributions of anterior cingulate cortex to motor function, it may also be productive to consider thalamocortical projections that are engaged during premotor activity in addition to the direct projections of anterior cingulate cortex to motor systems.

The anterior cingulate cortex mediates skeletomotor and autonomic activity as discussed below, and unilateral cingulate lesions in monkey produce contralateral motor neglect (Watson *et al.*, 1978). Figure 1 is a schematic view of the medial surface of the rhesus monkey brain onto which have been placed functional divisions of the anterior executive region. The concept of an executive region was originally proposed to account for the involvement of anterior cingulate cortex in many motor functions (Vogt *et al.*, 1992*a*). This region may be further divided in order to account for two different contributions to behaviour. A primary division



Fig. 1 Distribution of the two components of the anterior executive region for affect and cognition (approximate border of each denoted with a swish). The affect region includes visceromotor control cortex (VMCC) and a subregion of vocalization control cortex (VOCC). The cognition region includes a subset of cortex engaged in response selection, nociceptive cortex (NCC), and skeletomotor control cortex (SMCC). CC = corpus callosum; CS = cingulate sulcus.

within the anterior executive region is made here on the basis of contributions to affect and cognition. The affect division encompasses areas 25, 24 and 32 (Vogt, 1993; see Fig. 4). These areas are a projection site of the amygdala (Vogt et al., 1987; Van Hoesen et al., 1993), and the pivotal involvement of the amygdala in affect is well documented (e.g. LeDoux, 1991; Aggleton, 1992). Since electrical stimulation in any part of this cortical region can modulate autonomic functions (see below), one of the common features of its constituent areas is their involvement in visceromotor control. Another common feature of areas in the affect division are the pronounced projections to the periaqueductal grey (Müller-Preuss and Jürgens, 1976; Hardy and Leichnetz, 1981). The periaqueductal grey has been implicated in mediating affective defence and other emotional behaviours associated with flight and immobility (Siegel and Brutus, 1990; Bandler et al., 1991; Holstege, 1992). Thus, areas comprising the affect division of the anterior executive region have common features both in their inputs and outputs.

The cognition division has not been implicated in emotional behaviours, modulation of autonomic function, nor does it have substantial connections with the amygdala or periaqueductal grey. The cognitive division of the anterior executive region is characterized by its contributions to skeletomotor control as documented in monkey, while its involvement in nociception has been demonstrated in the human. The dissociation between affective and cognitive regions is also supported by connection studies. There are few connections between rostral area 24 and area 24'. In addition, there are reciprocal connections between the mid-levels of cingulate cortex and these two former areas (Vogt and Pandya, 1987).

Layer V contains many of the neurons that project to motor systems, and it is primarily responsible for the role of anterior cingulate cortex in executive functions. Human neurological syndromes associated with disruption of anterior cingulate cortex all involve disruption of some aspect of motor control or cognitive processes associated with motor or premotor events. The topographical specialization of motor function in anterior cingulate cortex is best demonstrated by its projections to the striatum. This region has projections to all major components of the striatum: the caudate nucleus, ventral striatum including the nucleus accumbens, and the putamen (Müller-Preuss and Jürgens, 1976; Yeterian and Van Hoesen, 1978; Baleydier and Mauguière, 1980).

Kunishio and Haber (1994) demonstrated important topographies in striatal projections that confirm cytoarchitectural delineations in anterior cingulate cortex and distinctions in motor function for different parts of the anterior executive region. Figure 2 presents three cases from their study and a sample coronal section from each with neurons retrogradely radio-labelled to emphasize differences in the topography of this projection. In the first case the retrograde tracer injection was into the shell region of the nucleus accumbens, in the second it was into the lateral division of the ventral striatum, and in the third it was in the dorsolateral part of the caudate nucleus. The distribution of labelled neurons differs in anterior cingulate cortex in the following ways. The nucleus accumbens injection labelled neurons mainly in areas 25 and ventral parts of area 24 including areas 24a and 24b. The ventral striatum injection labelled neurons in dorsal parts of area 24b and medial parts of area 24c. The third injection into the dorsolateral caudate nucleus labelled neurons in the depths of the cingulate sulcus in area 24c and to a lesser extent in area 24c'.

The differential projections of parts of anterior cingulate cortex to the striatum suggests that these cortical projection zones are engaged in different aspects of motor function. Thus, the dorsolateral striatum receives large projections from sensorimotor cortex and, as discussed below, area 24c' modulates skeletomotor activity and projects to the dorsolateral striatum. Neurons in this part of the striatum can acquire long-term changes in excitability during classical conditioning (Aosaki et al., 1994) and these response plasticities may be initiated or maintained by anterior cingulate cortex inputs. In contrast, rostral area 24 and area 25 project to the nucleus accumbens; a division of the ventral striatum which receives many inputs from other limbic structures including the amygdala and parahippocampal cortex (Russchen et al., 1985). Neurons in the ventral striatum discharge in relation to the reward properties of unconditional stimuli and may be involved in the motivational aspects of behaviour (Schultz et al., 1992). Although the stimulus significance of rewarding stimuli are probably determined by amygdala inputs to the ventral striatum, changes in neuronal responsivity to new environmental cues may be guided by anterior cingulate cortex.

In addition to differential projections to one motor structure like the striatum, heterogeneities in the contributions of anterior cingulate cortex to motor functions also are likely



Fig. 2 Distribution of retrogradely radio-labelled neurons in anterior cingulate cortex (dots) following injections into three parts of the striatum (solid areas in first of each series of sections). A single transverse section (B) was selected as an example of the topography of labelled neurons in the cingulate gyrus. These three cases show the differential topography of striatal projection neurons in anterior cingulate cortex. Modified with permission from Kunishio and Haber (1994).

from, anterior cingulate cortex projections to many components of the skeletomotor and autonomic nervous systems. Parts of anterior cingulate cortex can directly influence the following motor systems: (i) the autonomic nervous system via projections to the nucleus of the solitary tract and dorsal motor nucleus of the vagus; (ii) dorsolateral and ventromedial components of the skeletomotor system via projections to the spinal cord, red nucleus, and pontine nuclei; (iii) nuclei in the reticular formation that regulate integrated motor responses; and (iv) parts of the limbic system that are engaged in initiating behaviours related to the motivational significance of sensory stimuli such as the amygdala and periaqueductal grey. The remainder of this section summarizes the specific experimental anatomical and functional observations that support views of the role of anterior cingulate cortex in executive motor functions.

Visceromotor control cortex

Area 25 has several projection sites that may mediate visceromotor activity. In the rat and cat, area 25 projects directly to the parasympathetic nucleus of the solitary tract (Terreberry and Neafsey, 1983; Willett et al., 1986) and dorsal motor nucleus of the vagus (Room et al., 1985; Hurley et al., 1991). Area 25 also projects to the sympathetic thoracic intermediolateral cell column (Hurley et al., 1991). Although area 24 does not have similar connections, the projections of area 24 that mediate visceromotor function may include interactions with area 25 (Vogt and Pandya, 1987), orbitofrontal cortex (Morecraft et al., 1992) and projections to the peiaquaductal grey noted above. The rostral portion of area 24 and area 25 are part of the affect division (Fig. 1), which includes both direct visceromotor control from area 25 and indirect regulation by rostral area 24. The prominent connections between the amygdala and the visceromotor control region (Vogt and Pandya, 1987) may partly account for the important contributions of anterior cingulate cortex to affective behaviours.

Early anterior cingulate cortex electrical stimulation studies in cats, dogs and monkeys revealed prominent autonomic changes, including increases and decreases in blood pressure, heart and respiratory rates, and pyloric antral contractions (Smith, 1945; Kaada *et al.*, 1949; Kaada, 1951). Subsequent studies confirmed the effects of anterior cingulate cortex stimulation on virtually all autonomic and many endocrine functions. These include the cardiovascular, respiratory, digestive, thermoregulatory systems; increases in skin conductance; gonadal and adrenal cortical hormone secretion; drinking; penile erection; and aggression (Dua and MacLean, 1964; Setekleiv, 1964; Robinson and Mishkin, 1968; Lubar *et al.*, 1973; Cacerees and Taleisnnik, 1980; Hurley-Gius and Neafsey, 1986; Dunn, 1990; Neafsey, 1990; Buchanan and Powell, 1993).

In an animal model of emotional stress, the conditioned emotional response, anterior cingulate cortex modulates sympathetic nervous system responses, vocalization and respiratory responses (Neafsey et al., 1993). In the conditioned emotional response, an animal is presented a neutral conditioning stimulus (e.g. tone) followed by an emotionally aversive unconditional stimulus (e.g. footshock) (Smith and Nathan, 1967). In this model, autonomic and other physiological changes following the conditioning stimulus reflect anticipatory emotional responses. Lesions of anterior cingulate cortex in the rat significantly reduce heart rate changes (both tachycardia and bradycardia), respiratory inhibition and vocalization during the conditioning stimulus phase of the conditioned emotional response (Frysztak and Neafsey, 1991). In addition, lesions in dorsal parts of rabbit anterior cingulate cortex including area 24b attenuate classically conditioned bradycardia (Buchanan and Powell, 1982) and neurons in this area respond in specific patterns during classically conditioned changes in heart rate (Gibbs and Powell, 1991). Thus, areas 25 and 24 are involved in autonomic adjustments associated with classical conditioning.

Vocalization control cortex

Cingulate cortex has been directly implicated in vocalization in monkeys, cats and rats. Vocalization modulated by anterior cingulate cortex is considered in conjunction with visceromotor control because vocalization evoked from anterior cingulate cortex in non-human primates has affective content and appears to express primarily internal emotional states. Also, lesions of area 25 in rats abolish conditioned emotional, respiratory and vocalization responses to noxious footshock (Frysztak and Neafsey, 1991). Thus, in Fig. 1 the affect region includes functions associated with both visceromotor control cortex and vocalization control cortex.

Cingulate-modulated vocalizations are different from other skeletomotor activities because there are a limited number of vocalization patterns, while other skeletomotor responses frequently require generation of new patterns of muscle activity. Electrical stimulation of anterior cingulate cortex in monkeys evokes growling and cackling calls (Jürgens and Ploog, 1970) or arrests vocalization (Elliot, 1969). Removal of anterior cingulate cortex in cats and monkeys may lead to a transient increase or decrease in spontaneous and conditioned vocalizations (Smith, 1944; Kennard, 1955; Gomez and Mettler, 1962; Aitken, 1981) and learning of prolonged vocalization (Sutton *et al.*, 1974; Aitken, 1981). Even when spontaneous vocalization is reduced, however, animals can screech and scream normally in response to threats or attacks (Sutton *et al.*, 1974).

Cingulate-evoked vocalizations may be mediated by the periaqueductal grey because electrical stimulation there also evokes vocalizations, and ablation of the pathway connecting anterior cingulate cortex and the periaqueductal grey abolishes cingulate stimulation-evoked vocalizations (Jürgens and Pratt, 1979). Finally, the cingulate vocalization area appears distinct from the anterior cingulate motor areas (CMAs) and the region involved in nociception (Fig. 1). The vocalization region includes areas 32 and 24 and a rostral part of area 25 (Vogt and Barbas, 1988), while the CMAs lie in the depths of the cingulate sulcus, and the nociceptive region appears to include areas 24a' and 24b' on the cingulate gyral surface.

Skeletomotor control cortex

The dorsolateral skeletomotor system regulates distal musculature via the corticospinal and rubrospinal projections, while the ventromedial skeletomotor system regulates the axial musculature via the reticulospinal and vestibulospinal projections (for review, see Cheney et al., 1991). Cortex in the depths of the cingulate sulcus contains corticospinal projection neurons (Biber et al., 1978) and Dum and Strick (1993) defined three CMAs in the depths of cingulate sulcus; a rostral division (CMAr) in area 24c', a ventral division (CMAv) in posterior cingulate area 23c, and a dorsal division (CMAd) in area 6c. These areas have connections that are similar to premotor areas in prefrontal cortex including direct projections to the spinal cord (Dum and Strick, 1991) and reciprocal connections with primary motor cortex and the supplementary motor area (Moorecraft and Van Hoesen, 1992; Bates and Goldman-Rakic, 1993).

Electrophysiological studies confirm that anterior cingulate cortex regulates movement and may be engaged in premotor functions. Electrical stimulation of cortex in the ventral bank of the monkey cingulate sulcus evokes simple and complex movements from a somatotopically organized motor field (Luppino *et al.*, 1991) which appears to lie in area 24c'. Furthermore, neurons in the CMAs may prepare for movement. Single-unit neuronal discharges in these areas were evaluated in monkeys during sensory-triggered and self-paced forelimb movements (Shima *et al.*, 1991). Neuronal responses in CMAr preceded self-paced movements with long-lead times of 0.5–2.0 s, while responses in CMAv were related to sensory stimuli.

Nociceptive cortex and avoidance learning and memory

Schäffer and associates reported decreased pain sensitivity after cingulate lesions in monkeys (Brown and Schäfer, 1888; Horsley and Schäfer, 1888). Experimental studies in rats suggest that impaired conduction through the cingulum bundle disrupts the affective component of tonic pain (Vaccarino and Melzack, 1989). Although functional imaging studies of nociceptive responses are not available in non-human primates, anterior cingulate cortex involvement in human nociception is based on extensive neurosurgical and blood flow studies. Thus, part of caudal anterior cingulate cortex is outlined in Fig. 1 to approximate nociceptive cortex reported for human brain (Jones *et al.*, 1991*a*).

Individual neurons in a dorsal and anterior part of rabbit area 24 respond to noxious heat or mechanical stimuli (Sikes and Vogt, 1992). These responses have almost no stimulus localization information, since noxious stimuli anywhere on the body surface can activate most nociceptive neurons. The source of nociceptive inputs to anterior cingulate cortex may be the medial thalamic nuclei. The anterior cingulate cortex receives significant inputs from the midline thalamic nuclei which themselves contain nociceptive neurons in the monkey (Vogt *et al.*, 1979) and rabbit (Vogt *et al.*, 1992b). In addition, reduced activity in these nuclei with lidocaine blocks nociceptive activity in anterior cingulate cortex (Sikes and Vogt, 1992). Thus, anterior cingulate cortex receives nociceptive afferents, and is involved in some aspect(s) of assessing painful stimuli.

The anterior cingulate cortex may be involved in the following aspects of pain sensation: (i) specifying the affective content of noxious stimuli; (ii) motor response selection for noxious stimuli; (iii) learning associated with the prediction and avoidance of noxious stimuli. Controlled testing paradigms demonstrate subtle deficits following bilateral cingulectomy. These included increased errors and impaired precision in learning and impaired acquisition and maintenance of avoidance responses (Pribram and Kruger, 1954; Pechtel et al., 1958; Peretz, 1960; McCleary, 1961). In discriminative avoidance learning, animals learn to avoid an aversive unconditional stimulus by discriminating between a positive conditioning stimulus (e.g. a tone that reliably predicts footshock) and a negative conditioning stimulus (e.g. a tone that does not predict footshock). Lesions of anterior cingulate cortex in rabbits retard acquisition of discriminative avoidance learning (Gabriel et al., 1989, 1991), while multiunit recordings in anterior cingulate cortex during avoidance learning suggest that this area is involved in task acquisition or processes involving early training-induced neuronal activity (Gabriel et al., 1991). Gabriel (1993) suggests that the principal brain modification underlying discriminative avoidance learning is the 'construction of cingulate cortical command volleys and the plasticity that makes these volleys contingent on the external presence of the learning context and the positive conditioning stimulus'.

Studies in electrical self-stimulation, a model of reinforcement, initially focused on the medial forebrain bundle and lateral hypothalamus (Olds and Milner, 1954; Olds and Olds, 1963). However, self-stimulation behaviour occurs in anterior cingulate cortex, although the characteristics differ from medial forebrain bundle sites (Porrino, 1993). In contrast to medial forebrain bundle self-stimulation behaviour, anterior cingulate cortex and other limbic sites require longer acquisition times, have lower rates of responding, require higher current levels to obtain responses and are not facilitated by food deprivation or amphetamines (Goodall and Carey, 1975; Robertson et al., 1981, 1982; Corbett et al., 1982). Also, unlike the medial forebrain bundle, anterior cingulate cortex self-stimulation does not plateau but is strengthened over time (Douglin and Glassman, 1979). The initial lack of reinforcement and progressive enhancement of selfstimulation have been attributed to synaptic plasticity (Corbett et al., 1982) and likened to kindling (Corbett and Stellar, 1983). Interestingly, short inter-stimulus intervals retard both

kindling and anterior cingulate cortex self-stimulation (Goddard *et al.*, 1969; Corbett *et al.*, 1982) and anticonvulsant drugs retard the development of cingulate self-stimulation (Robertson *et al.*, 1982).

Social interactions

Traditional systems analysis in neurobiology focuses on sensorimotor activity and these approaches have proven useful in assessing anterior cingulate cortex function. However, complex social interactions such as maternal–infant interactions involve a level of brain organization beyond that subserved by simple sensorimotor reflex arcs. Several of these interactions may involve affect and executive functions subserved by anterior cingulate cortex and long-term memories possibly stored in posterior cingulate cortex. The analysis of sensorimotor reflexes will not explain such complex functions of anterior cingulate cortex. Lesion studies provide the bulk of information that hints at the role of anterior cingulate cortex in social interactions.

The most commonly reported persistent behavioural changes following anterior cingulate cortex lesions included the following: reduced and, occasionally, increased aggressivity, diminished shyness and fear of man, emotional blunting, decreased motivation, disruption of mating behaviour, impaired maternal–infant interactions, impatience, lowered threshold for fear or startle responses, and inappropriate intraspecies social behaviour (Smith, 1944; Ward, 1948*a*, *b*; Glees *et al.*, 1950; Kennard, 1955; Pechtel *et al.*, 1958; Larsson, 1962). Area 24 lesions in infant monkeys impair the separation cry when the infant is removed from the mother and disrupt the mother's ability to attend to the infant (MacLean and Newman, 1988).

Although there have been some reports that bilateral cingulectomy fails to produce significant changes in social behaviour in monkeys (Pribram and Fulton, 1954; Gomez and Mettler, 1962; Meyers, 1975), there are a number of possible explanations for the different observations. Behavioural changes after cingulectomy may reflect species differences as well as differences in lesion sites and in the testing context. For example, caged rhesus monkeys are more aggressive towards humans than are free-ranging monkeys. Furthermore, results may vary according to the methods for studying and quantifying behaviour. Most consistent findings have followed structured behavioural evaluations (e.g. impaired learning, avoidance responses, contralateral motor neglect).

Although the specific contributions of anterior cingulate cortex to social behaviours is not known, these experimental lesion studies have served an important role for interpreting the consequences of stroke in humans. In addition, the finding of docile behaviour after bilateral cingulectomy (Smith, 1944; Ward, 1948*a*; Kennard, 1955) led several neurosurgical groups to perform this procedure in humans for disorders of aggression, agitation, psychosis, and compulsive behaviour (Whitty, 1952; LeBeau, 1954; Ballantine *et al.*, 1987). These

efforts further suggested a potential use of cingulate lesions for the relief of pain (Foltz and White, 1962; Ballantine *et al.*, 1967).

Anterior cingulate cortex in the rostral limbic system

Before addressing the role of anterior cingulate cortex in human brain function, one further theoretical issue should be considered. Some investigators hesitate to use the limbic system concept because this system is difficult to define, extremely heterogeneous in terms of its structure and functions, and there is little evidence that it operates as a single entity (Brodal, 1981). MacLean (1990, 1993) has made a case for this conceptualization from an evolutionary perspective, and it has particular value for assessing structures involved in social interactions. A modified viewpoint, however, is suggested from studies of cingulate cortex that may be more readily reconciled with recent experimental observations. A dichotomy in the cingulate gyrus has been proposed (Vogt et al., 1992a) because anterior and posterior cingulate cortices are characterized by very different cytoarchitecture, connections and functions. In contrast to the anterior cingulate cortex, the posterior region has the following characteristics: (i) a prominent layer IV; (ii) thalamic inputs from the anterodorsal, anteroventral, laterodorsal and medial pulvinar nuclei; (iii) involvement in visuospatial and memory functions; (iv) limited access to motor systems via projections to the striatum, premotor projections of area 23c, and projections to the pontine nuclei.

In view of the striking dichotomy in cingulate cortex structure and function, the cingulate cortex may be conceptualized as participating in two distinct parts of the limbic system. A rostral part engaged in executive functions including those associated with affect and a caudal part involved in visuospatial and memory functions; in other words, rostral and caudal limbic systems, respectively. In this context the rostral limbic system includes the amygdala and septum, and orbitofrontal, anterior insula, and anterior cingulate cortices, the ventral striatum including the accumbens nucleus, and several brainstem motor nuclei including the periaquaductal grey. The caudal limbic system includes the hippocampus, and posterior parietal, posterior parahippocampal, and posterior cingulate cortices, and the dorsal striatum. Area 24' would be a transitional region in this conceptualization of two limbic systems.

All components of the rostral limbic system are not uniformly engaged during any particular behavioural function. Similarly, sensory and motor cortices are not uniformly engaged during sensory stimulation or movement, respectively. The concept of the rostral limbic system does suggest that there are structures with common connections that potentially operate in unison to produce a particular functional output. One interesting perspective on the rostral limbic system is provided in recent studies by Ketter *et al.* (1994) in which blood flow was evaluated in individuals following intravenous administration of procaine. These injections produce emotional and psychosensory experiences that are associated with activation of anterior cingulate cortex (including areas 24 and 24'), the amygdala, orbitofrontal and anterior insular cortices. Although the mechanism of procaine's actions are not known, it is impressive that such a system can be activated simultaneously without coactivation of any parts of the caudal limbic system.

In conclusion, anterior cingulate cortex is an agranular cortical region that has extensive projections into motor systems and is involved in many executive functions including those that are associated with affect. The consequences of strokes on the medial surface and primary epileptic foci therein should be considered in the context of these connections and electrical stimulation findings. In addition, anterior cingulate cortex is part of the rostral limbic system which includes the amygdala, ventral striatum, periaquaductal grey, orbitofrontal and dorsolateral prefrontal cortices, and the anterior insula. Subdivisions of each of these areas form matrices that implement motor functions relevant to particular external events.

Structure of human anterior cingulate cortex *Surface features*

Although non-human primates have a single, constant, and non-segmented cingulate sulcus, medial surface features in the human brain are extremely variable. Figure 3 shows two examples of medial surfaces and some of the variations in cingulate gyrus and sulcus morphology. The first is an example of a single cingulate sulcus that is not segmented. In this case the splenial sulcus anastomoses with the cingulate sulcus and the parascentral sulcus, which is usually a vertical branch of the cingulate sulcus, is detatched therefrom and bifurcates. In the anterior cingulate gyrus there are two horizontal dimples or shallow depressions. In the second case there is a double parallel pattern of cingulate sulci (Ono et al., 1990). The cingulate sulcus is segmented into two parts, while the superior cingulate sulcus is non-segmented and anastomoses with the cingulate sulcus ventral to the genu of the corpus callosum. This pattern of sulci produces two cingulate gyri with the superior cingulate gyrus lying dorsal and rostral to the cingulate sulcus.

Distribution of areas

The cytoarchitecture and distribution of areas in human anterior cingulate cortex have been described (Vogt *et al.*, 1995). The following comments provide a summary of this work to guide the analysis of anterior cingulate cortex function and includes a cytoarchitectural map in Fig. 4 which is a schematic generalization from a number of cases. This modification of Brodmann's (1909) original work was necessitated by the high level of cytoarchitectonic and

A. SINGLE CINGULATE SULCUS



B. DOUBLE PARALLEL CINGULATE SULCI



Fig. 3 Features of the medial surfaces for two human cases with different sulcal patterns. In the first case (*top*) there is a single cingulate sulcus (CS) and cingulate gyrus (CG) with horizontal cortical dimples in anterior cingulate cortex (curved arrows) and a vertical dimple in posterior cingulate cortex (straight arrow). The second case (*bottom*) with a double parallel pattern of sulci has a segmented cingulate sulcus (CS1, CS2), a superior cingulate sulcus (SCS) and a superior cingulate gyrus (SCG) between the two sulci. The CS1 anastomoses with the SCS at the curved arrow below the genu of the corpus callosum (solid black). CeS = central sulcus; IRS = inferior rostral sulcus; MR = marginal ramus of the cingulate sulcus; SpS = splenial sulcus; SRS = superior rostral sulcus.

connection details available for non-human primates. Furthermore, the numerous functional imaging studies now available identify different parts of anterior cingulate cortex as critically engaged in many human behaviours. Localization of cortical activation sites must be guided by current views of the morphology of the medial cortex. Also, investigators need a common language for functional observations.

One of the outstanding features of anterior cingulate cortex cytoarchitecture is its prominant layer V neurons; differences in layer V morphology usually characterize each area in anterior cingulate cortex. The distribution of these areas is shown in Fig. 4 where anterior cingulate cortex is outlined by the dashed line. Areas 32 and 32' form a dorsal rim around area 24 and are included in anterior cingulate cortex, although they are referred to as cingulofrontal transition areas. They are transitional because they share features of both



Fig. 4 Schematic overview of the distribution of areas on the human anterior cingulate cortex. The asterisk is the rostral tip of the corpus callosum which itself forms the depths of the callosal sulcus (CaS, dot-dash line). The dorsal and ventral borders of the cingulate gyrus are labelled (db and vb for CG, respectively) and the depths of the cingulate sulcus is indicated (CS, dot-dash line).

cingulate and frontal cortices. Thus, they have a prominent cingulate layer V, while also having a thin layer IV and large layer IIIc pyramidal neurons which is characteristic of some prefrontal areas. Areas 25 and 33 are the least differentiated in anterior cingulate cortex with only external and internal pyramidal layers and a hint of large neurons in layer Va. The a, b and c divisions of areas 24 and 24' are progressive differentiations not originally reported by Brodmann. As a rule, cortex adjacent to the corpus callosum is poorly differentiated, although a layer Va is clear as is the distinction between layers II and III. Dorsal areas have a more prominent layer II/III border. Area 24b includes the magnocellular anterogenual field of Braak (1979). This area has the broadest and most dense layer V in the cingulate gyrus. Differences between rostral area 24 and caudal area 24' include one of neuron density in that area 24 has a generally higher neuron density than does area 24'. In addition, layers III and Va are thinner in area 24' than in area 24. Finally, cortex in the depths of the cingulate sulcus undergoes a rostrocaudal differentiation: (i) area 24c has the thickest layer Va; (ii) area 24c' has a sparse layer III and layer Vb has many mediumsized neurons; (iii) area 24c'g has many medium-sized pyramidal neurons in layer Va and the largest pyramids in the cingulate gyrus in layer Vb. Area 24c'g is simlar to Braak's (1976) primitive gigantopyramidal field, it abuts area 32' at its rostral border, and it likely has spinal projection neurons.

Although the resolution of most PET scanners is 7–10 mm, it is possible, in some instances, to relate activation sites to the cingulate gyral surface and the depths of the cingulate sulcus. This distinction is extremely important because it is in the depths of the cingulate sulcus where the cingulate motor areas with their spinal projection neurons are located. In addition, the dichotomy within anterior cingulate cortex of cognitive and affective regions is probably best

made with a line drawn just caudal to the border of area 32 and including most of area 24, area 25 and much of area 33. While area 24' may be related to some affective processes, most evidence suggests that its role in affect is secondary to its role in cognitive processes, such as response selection, that do not require affect.

Contributions to human behaviour *Executive functions*

Neglect follows anterior cingulate cortex lesions in primates and this is one reason that anterior cingulate cortex is considered part of a matrix of cortical areas involved in attention. Thus, unilateral motor neglect followed unilateral anterior cingulate cortex lesions in monkeys (Watson et al., 1973), and hypokinesia and hypometria arose contralateral to a right anterior cingulate cortex and supplementary motor area lesion in one patient (Meador et al., 1986). Hypokinesia improved when the affected left upper extremity was placed into the right hemispace suggesting hemispatial motor neglect. Sensory neglect also occurs after anterior cingulate cortex lesions. A woman with a right anterior cingulate cavitary lesion developed depression, anosognosia for a left hemiparesis, visual and somatesthetic neglect, and contralateral hemibody neglect (Heilman and Valenstein, 1972). In another case, a severe attentional deficit arose with bilateral anterior cerebral artery infarcts in the anterior cingulate gyri, the fornices and small areas of adjacent prefrontal cortex (Laplane et al., 1981). Although these case studies suggest a role for anterior cingulate cortex in attention, functional imaging with PET has shown that anterior cingulate cortex is not engaged in all attentional processes. For example, although the left dorsolateral prefrontal cortex is activated when reading words and during semantic processing, anterior cingulate cortex is silent (Petersen et al., 1990). Thus, specific roles for anterior cingulate cortex beyond that of general attention must be considered.

The anterior cingulate cortex has a role in premotor function and some cognitively demanding processes and is often engaged in responses associated with affect. The anterior cingulate cortex is involved in direct control of skeletal and visceromotor systems, response selection, cognitively demanding processing not necessarily requiring movement, and possibly retrieval from short-term memory. The common features of each of these anterior cingulate cortex functions is that they occur well before a movement occurs. Although anterior cingulate cortex in the depths of the cingulate sulcus has the architecture, connections, and neuronal discharge patterns characteristic of premotor areas (Dum and Strick, 1993), there are events which must precede motor activity beyond determining the pattern of muscle contractions to attain a goal. Cognitive processes to determine whether or not a movement is needed and the correct response pattern probably involve early premotor processing and this is one of the primary contributions of anterior cingulate cortex to

human behaviour. The following discussion is organized according to the topography of functional regions in anterior cingulate cortex beginning with visceromotor control and affect.

Visceromotor control and vocalization

Autonomic activity is a frequent correlate of affective behaviour, and visceromotor changes are the most consistent responses evoked by electrical stimulation of rostral area 24 and area 25. Both increases and decreases in respiratory and cardiac rate and blood pressure, mydriasis, piloerection, and facial flushing can occur (Pool and Ransohoff, 1949; Pool, 1954; Escobedo et al., 1973; Talairach et al., 1973). Visceral responses include nausea, vomiting, epigastric sensation, salivation, or bowel or bladder evacuation (Pool and Ransohoff, 1949; Lewin and Whitty, 1960; Meyer et al., 1973). Respiratory arrest occurs with cingulate stimulation, although patients can breath to command (Penfield and Jasper, 1954; Escobedo et al., 1973; Meyer et al., 1973). This contrasts with the non-volitional inhibition of motor responses evoked by primary motor cortex stimulation, and supports the role of anterior cingulate cortex in motor acts that can be modulated volitionally through other neural systems.

The anterior cingulate cortex in the perigenual region of non-human primates is involved in vocalizations associated with the expression of internal states and in some conditioning paradigms (see above). Although mutism can result from large lesions in human anterior cingulate cortex and adjacent areas, as discussed below, human vocalization is rarely altered by anterior cingulate cortex electrical stimulation. Involuntary vocalization or speech arrest is rarely if ever produced in humans with electrical stimulation, but it is more common with cingulate seizures (Whitty et al., 1952; Pool, 1954; Talairach et al., 1973; Van Buren and Fedio, 1976). Momentary arrest of speech or respiration also occurs in isolated stimulation cases (Lewin and Whitty, 1960). In contrast to other studies, Meyer and colleagues (1973) commonly observed alterations in speech with cingulate stimulation: dysphasia, perseveration, and change in rate or volume. It still is not known whether anterior cingulate cortex is engaged during highly emotional expressions such as 'AAAH' or 'EEEK' that are very short-latency, non-linguistic expressions of fright or other emotional states.

Cingulate dysfunction in stuttering supports a contribution of anterior cingulate cortex to verbal expression. Pool *et al.* (1991) studied xenon-133 single photon emission computed tomography (SPECT) in 20 children with stuttering and in age-matched control cases. They found reduced blood flow in the left perigenual part of anterior cingulate cortex and in the superior and middle temporal gyri in the stutterers. With only one exception, all severe stutterers had decreased blood flow in the anterior cingulate cortex. Furthermore, although blood flow in anterior cingulate cortex is elevated during processing of words (Petersen *et al.*, 1988; Grossman *et al.*, 1992) suggesting a role in word and sentence selection, this is part of a general role of anterior cingulate cortex in response selection (*see* below), not a specific language function nor necessarily a contribution to the interpretation of the emotional significance of words *per se*. Each of these observations on human anterior cingulate cortex and its contributions to language suggest that area 24' is engaged in word and sentence selection as part of a broader response selection function and that perigenual cortex is involved in vocalization, although the evidence that it is engaged in the expression of emotionally charged vocalizations in humans, as in non-human primates, is not yet available.

Affect

Emotion is mediated, at least in part, by anterior cingulate cortex as indicated by electrical stimulation and spontaneous seizures in humans and in some individuals with either spontaneous or neurosurgically induced cingulate lesions. Emotional responses may follow electrical stimulation of anterior cingulate cortex including fear, pleasure and agitation (Meyer *et al.*, 1973). Electrical stimulation of different parts of anterior cingulate cortex evokes different types of emotions (Bancaud and Talairach, 1992). Stimulation of part of area 24' in an epilepsy patient evoked the report, 'I felt something, as though I were going to leave,' while stimulation of perigenual area 24 produced this response, 'I was afraid and my heart started to beat.' This supports the very important dissociation between the role of area 24' in avoidance behaviours and that of area 24 in affect.

Euphoria and a sense of well-being have been reported (Laitinen and Vilkki, 1973; Talairach *et al.*, 1973), while some investigators could not elicit emotional responses with electrical stimulation (Lewin and Whitty, 1960; Escobedo *et al.*, 1973; Van Buren and Fedio, 1976). Affective responses during stimulation of other brain regions also are uncommon. For example, only 1% of mesial temporal lobe stimuli elicit affective responses (Halgren *et al.*, 1978). Among patients with cingulate seizure foci (*see* below), emotional changes are common during ictal (e.g. laughing, crying) and interictal (e.g. irritability, sexual deviancy, emotional lability) periods.

Cingulate tumors and other lesions in humans can cause a variety of affective changes, including apathy, disinhibition, placidity, depression, aggressiveness, lack of social restraint, anxiety, obsessive-compulsive behaviours, heightened sexuality, and bulimia (Ironside and Guttmacher, 1929; Frazier. 1936; Jarvie, 1954; Malamud, 1967; Faris, 1969; Poeck, 1969; Gautier-Smith, 1970; Angelini *et al.*, 1981; Levin and Duchowny, 1991). Further, cingulectomy and cingulumotomy can successfully treat patients with psychosis and pathological aggression, obsessive-compulsive behaviours, and depression (Whitty *et al.*, 1952; Lewin, 1961; Ballantine *et al.*, 1967; Brown and Lighthill, 1968; Ledesma and Paniagua, 1969; Mazars, 1970). Ballantine *et al.* (1967) found that cingulumotomy improved behaviour in the majority of a combined series of 150 patients with various neuropsychiatric disorders in which 'disordered affect' was a dominant feature.

A PET study of healthy women showed that transient sadness or happiness are associated with elevated blood flow in anterior cingulate cortex (George et al., 1994b). The most active site appears to be a region including area 25. Furthermore, activity in the cingulate during happiness is inversely related with blood flow in the amygdala, while sadness is proportionately related to elevated blood flow in the amygdala. Evidence for the involvement of area 24 in recognizing the emotional content in facial expressions derives from a PET study by George and colleagues (1993) and emphasizes its role in emotion. In this study blood flow in area 24 was elevated with photographs of facial expressions with emotional content. Thus, electrical stimulation and PET studies confirm the involvement of areas 24 and 25 in affect, while area 24' has little direct involvement in such functions. In addition, reciprocal connections between areas 24/25 and the amygdala are probably engaged during internal states associated with emotion.

Movement execution

Cortex in the depths of the cingulate sulcus regulates skeletomotor activity and shares many features classically associated with premotor areas. Electrical stimulation studies of human anterior cingulate cortex provide other important clues to its motor functions. Stimulation has been undertaken before cingulectomy for psychiatric and, less often, seizure disorders. Methodological differences in terms of electrode placement and stimulus intensity and waveform characteristics probably account for most of the variability in the reported series. Electrical stimulation of anterior cingulate cortex elicits a spectrum of behavioural changes including autonomic and affective, involuntary vocalization, speech arrest and automatic behaviours. Primitive gestures include touching, kneading, rubbing, or pressing fingers or hands together, and lip puckering or sucking (Escobedo et al., 1973; Meyer et al., 1973; Talairach et al., 1973). These movements are often adapted to the environment; they can be modified with sensory stimuli and, at times, resisted. Hand movements can be bilateral or contralateral to the stimulated side. Other studies have reported restlessness, complex movements mainly of the contralateral leg (Escobedo et al., 1973), pedalling movements (Bancaud et al., 1976), rubbing of the face, lip-smacking, and picking at bedclothes (Meyer et al., 1973). These latter automatisms are common with temporal lobe (Theodore et al., 1983) and orbitofrontal (Swartz, 1994) complex partial seizures, and, interestingly, as postcingulectomy 'tics' (Whitty et al., 1952).

Since the supplementary motor area mediates the preparation and initiation of movement (Deecke and Kornhuber, 1978; Orgogozo and Larsen, 1979; Roland *et al.*, 1980; Verfaellie and Heilman, 1987), it may operate in conjunction with or even be activated by the CMAs (Goldberg, 1985). Schlaug *et al.* (1994) used PET to show

that during sequential thumb-finger apposition movements two divisions of the supplementary motor area were activated as well as part of anterior cingulate cortex. It is possible in this latter study that there was activation of one of the CMAs. Thus, the connections between anterior cingulate cortex and supplementary motor area may be particularly important including those between area 24c' in the depths of the cingulate sulcus and the supplementary motor area (Morecraft and Van Hoesen, 1992; Bates and Goldman-Rakic, 1993). Interruption of connections between these areas by medial frontal lesions may contribute to motor neglect and other impairments of sensorimotor and early premotor processing.

Response selection and cognition

The anterior cingulate cortex is engaged in early premotor events that require cognitive information processing and response selection where a movement may be needed. Blood flow in anterior cingulate cortex increases during semantic processing of single words or letters (Petersen et al., 1988; Frith et al., 1991a; Grossman et al., 1992), target detection tasks (Posner et al., 1988; Posner and Peterson, 1990), and the Stroop interference task (Pardo et al., 1990). The contribution of anterior cingulate cortex to this latter task is particularly important, since behavioural performance is related to blood flow in anterior cingulate cortex (George et al., 1994a). Frith et al. (1991b) compared blood flow during routine and willed acts. Routine acts included repeating words or responding with the previously rehearsed opposite word (e.g. hot-cold). Willed acts required an open-ended response and thus a deliberate choice. Willed acts in two response modes (verbal and lifting a finger) were associated with increased blood flow in the dorsolateral prefrontal cortex and, less prominently, in the anterior cingulate cortex. The Stroop test responses are entirely determined by the stimulus, as opposed to willed responses. Since anterior cingulate cortex but not dorsolateral prefrontal cortex cerebral blood flow is increased during the Stroop, Frith et al. (1991b) argue that dorsolateral prefrontal cortex is essential for willed acts. However, the significant increase in anterior cingulate cortex blood flow with willed acts suggests that anterior cingulate cortex also contributes to willed actions.

The contributions of anterior cingulate cortex to response selection has been refined in a number of recent PET studies. Raichle *et al.* (1994) showed that the region activated in left anterior cingulate cortex by a verb generation to a novel list of nouns was mainly in area 32'. When the list of nouns was re-used a number of times, the response habituated, while the anterior cingulate cortex response returned with a novel list of nouns. In addition, the left dorsolateral prefrontal and cerebellar cortices were activated, while the anterior insula had reduced blood flow. Petit *et al.* (1993) showed that cortex in the depths of the cingulate sulcus and the midcingulate gyral surface (i.e. area 24') is involved in response selections associated with saccadic eye movements. Subjects performing self-paced voluntary horizontal saccadic eye movements at

maximal amplitude activated this region. The elevation of anterior cingulate cortex blood flow included areas 24c' and 23c and was higher than any other cortical area including the supplementary motor area. The anterior cingulate cortex is not engaged directly in eye movement generation per se because it does not have brainstem projections like the frontal eye fields and cingulate neuronal responses associated with saccadic and quick-phase eye movements occur after not before the movement (Sikes et al., 1988; Olson et al., 1993). Also, the frontal eye fields do not project to cingulate cortex (Stanton et al., 1993). This common misconception is fostered by anatomical studies in which authors do not carefully identify the rostral limits of the frontal eye fields. Thus, anterior cingulate cortex is involved in response selection when any of a wide range of novel choices are required, but not during practiced responses.

The contributions of anterior cingulate cortex to response selection and attention to action is supported by a study of patients with primary depression (Bench *et al.*, 1992). In these patients, blood flow was decreased in anterior cingulate cortex. This altered blood flow pattern was not associated with depression-related cognitive impairment, but, rather, depressed mood. Therefore, functional disruption of anterior cingulate cortex in depression may contribute to impaired initiation and organization of behaviour.

The response selection functions discussed so far may be part of a broader contribution of anterior cingulate cortex to cognitively demanding information processing. In visual discrimination tasks requiring divided attention for two features of a stimulus (Corbetta *et al.*, 1991), maximal activation occurs near the gyral surface of anterior cingulate cortex (i.e. areas 24a' and 24b'). Blood flow in a region that appears to be in area 24b was not significantly altered in the same divided attention task. In less challenging auditory discriminations involving little decision making and simple movements, there was a reduction of blood flow in anterior cingulate cortex (Cohen *et al.*, 1988). Thus, when suspending movement while waiting for low probability signals, reduced activity in anterior cingulate cortex may enhance detection of an external signal (Posner and Petersen, 1990).

When considering the topography of activation sites in PET studies, it is difficult to assess the extent to which areas 24' and 32' contribute to similar or different functions. Tasks requiring target assessment and attention for linguistic and other features of the sensory environment may engage area 32', while cognitively demanding tasks that may or may not require a movement may engage area 24'.

Responses to pain

Foltz and White (1962) found that anxious patients who 'augmented' their pain were most likely to benefit from cingulumotomy. Patients with chronic pain disorders treated successfully with cingulumotomy report that they may continue to 'feel the pain' but it does not bother them or trigger any adverse emotional reaction. 'The perception of pain as such does not appear to be modified, but the patient's total reaction to pain and the threat to existence that it represents is modified markedly. Most of the patients stated that they continued to have pain but it was 'not particularly bothersome,' 'doesn't worry me . . .' (Foltz and White, 1962). Following cingulumotomy, patients with chronic pain could often be withdrawn from narcotic analgesics with minimal or no signs of withdrawal (Foltz and White, 1962).

Extensive neuropsychological and psychiatric evaluations have been performed on patients before and after cingulumotomy. Overall, IQ usually increases slightly or shows no change (Meyer et al., 1973; US Department of Health, Education and Welfare, 1977; Corkin et al., 1979; Ballantine et al., 1987). The mechanism for increased IO scores postcingulumotomy is unknown, but most likely results from diminished anxiety, depression and obsessive thoughts, which leads to improved motivation and concentration. Also, cognitive performance may improve when medications are lowered after surgery. Wilson and Chang (1974) observed neurological sequelae that quickly resolved, including bladder and bowel incontinence, confusion, uninhibited facetious speech, diminished attention span, hallucinations and automatisms. Flattened affect was common (57%) and often persisted at the time of hospital discharge.

There has long been a question as to whether postcingulumotomy observations of altered responses to noxious stimuli were due to disruption of cingulate cortex itself or to disruption of axons of passage underlying cingulate cortex. A direct role of anterior cingulate cortex in processing nociceptive information has been provided by three PET studies. These studies show that anterior cingulate cortex is activated during the application of acute, noxious-heat stimuli to the body surface (Jones *et al.*, 1991*a*; Talbot *et al.*, 1991; Casey *et al.*, 1994).

Functional imaging studies suggest that cingulate and prefrontal cortices may respond together during responses to noxious stimuli in chronic pain syndromes. Administration of morphine to an individual suffering from chronic pain following removal of a squamous carcinoma in the left jaw elevated blood flow in anterior cingulate cortex as well as in prefrontal and insular cortices (Jones et al., 1991b). The joint activation of these cortices may be the product of shared expression of opioid receptors or reflect reorganization of common inputs from brainstem nociceptive nuclei such as the midline thalamic nuclei. Cingulate cortex may interact directly with prefrontal cortex as suggested in cases of atypical facial pain. When noxious thermal stimuli are applied to the skin of these patients, blood flow is elevated in anterior cingulate cortex and reduced in prefrontal cortex (Derbyshire et al., 1994). There are strong and reciprocal connections between dorsal, middle and inferior prefrontal cortices and anterior cingulate cortex (Pandya et al., 1981; Vogt and Pandya, 1987; Barbas and Pandya, 1989). Although there are several possibilities to account for the differential regulation of responses to noxious stimuli in these areas, a likely one is that anterior cingulate cortex inhibits activity in prefrontal cortex during noxious stimulation.

The specific role of anterior cingulate cortex in pain is not vet known. The options include generating an affective component, organizing motor responses, or memory associated with predicting and avoiding such stimuli without actually allowing them to be presented to the body surface. The general lack of evidence for emotional activity and memory associated with area 24' function may indicate that the role of anterior cingulate cortex in pain is response selection processes. Nonetheless, after 100 years of clinical and experimental observations, it appears that the first conclusions of Horsely and Schäfer (1888) were correct. Lesions of anterior cingulate cortex reduce pain sensitivity and are not the result of collateral damage to other structures. Strategies for relieving pain, whether surgical or pharmacological, can now legitimately focus on anterior cingulate cortex as one of the likely areas that organizes responses to noxious stimuli and may be involved in chronic pain syndromes.

Short-term declarative memory

Animal studies of Gabriel and his colleagues (Gabriel, 1993) suggest that anterior cingulate cortex is involved in the early stages of discriminative avoidance learning, while posterior cingulate cortex is involved in long-term performance of acquired tasks. A human case with a small infarct in posterior cingulate cortex (Valenstein et al., 1987) had a profound disruption of both anterograde and retrograde memory. Limited information using functional imaging supports the contributions of anterior cingulate cortex to learning and memory. Raichle et al. (1994) showed that verb selection in response to repeated presentations of a list of nouns reduced anterior cingulate cortex blood flow (i.e. over time the response habituates). For well-learned lists the response disappears and use of a novel list of nouns increases blood flow in anterior cingulate cortex. Grasby et al. (1993) showed that perigenual parts of anterior cingulate cortex have elevated blood flow during auditory-verbal memory by subtracting blood flow during a subspan memory task from that for a supraspan memory task. Interestingly, a part of posterior cingulate cortex including areas 31, 23, 29 and 30 were also activated in the supraspan task. In a [⁵F]fluorodeoxyglucose PET (FDG-PET) study of 11 amnestic patients, Fazio et al. (1992) found bilateral metabolic reductions in the hippocampal formation, thalamus, cingulate gyri and frontal basal cortex. This supports a role of anterior cingulate cortex in a memory network.

Events related to early processing of stimuli and preparation for motor responses appear to be registered in anterior cingulate cortex, however, they are not retained for long periods of time. During short-term verbal memory tasks there is joint activation of perigenual and perisplenial cingulate cortices (Grasby *et al.*, 1993). Since these regions are reciprocally connected (Vogt and Pandya, 1987; Van Hoesen et al., 1993), it is possible that, when long-term memories are needed, they are stored in posterior cingulate cortex and are accessed in anterior cingulate cortex via these reciprocal connections. Notice also that the midlevels of cingulate cortex, including areas 24' and rostral parts of area 23, are not connected directly to the perigenual and perisplenial cortices (Vogt and Pandya, 1987); thus there may be an uncoupling of response selection processes from this part of the medial memory circuits.

Social interactions

Structural or functional changes in anterior cingulate cortex can cause prominent changes in social behaviour. Patients with cingulate lesions or epilepsy can develop blunted affect, apathy, impulsivity, disinhibition, aggressive behaviour with minimal or no provocation, psychosis, sexually deviant behaviour, disabling obsessions and compulsions, and impaired social judgement (Ironside and Guttmacher, 1929; Vonderahe, 1943; Ward, 1948b; Jarvie, 1954; Ledesma and Paniagua, 1969; Mazars, 1970; Damasio and Van Hoesen, 1983; Levin and Duchowny, 1991). These behaviours can seriously impair social success. In some cases, patients have been diagnosed with 'sociopathic personality disorder,' been institutionalized or prosecuted for criminal actions (Mazars, 1970; Bancaud and Talairach, 1992). Following elective bilateral cingulectomy for psychiatric disorders, there may be impaired personal and social judgment (Tow and Whitty, 1953).

Following bilateral anterior cingulate cortex and orbitofrontal damage after tumour resection, a previously successful accountant was unable to maintain his job, marriage and finances despite preserved 'intelligence and memory' (Eslinger and Damasio, 1985). His problems appeared largely due to a lack of judgement and common sense. Thus, the social consequences of combined anterior cingulate cortex and orbitofrontal cortex damage can be devastating. This man, despite normal intelligence and memory, failed 'in real life'. His ability to interpret social cues and adapt to social situations was severely impaired. Although he could recall normal patterns of social behaviour when questioned about them in a hypothetical setting, he could not execute correct actions in real life situations. Many of his disastrous actions were labelled as 'sociopathic'. When his skin conductance was measured during exposure to emotional visual images of mutilation, nudity and social disaster, there was virtually no response (Damasio et al., 1990). Thus, there was a disconnection between the intellectual understanding of the images and the autonomic expression with anterior cingulate cortex and orbitofrontal lesions. The lack of physiological emotional cues may contribute to this patient's failure to appreciate the emotional significance of stimuli. Notably, sociopathic individuals often had blunted autonomic responses to emotional stimuli (Hare, 1978). The frontal lesion might lead to failure to develop the emotion that leads to the autonomic changes, or the frontal lesion may prevent

the autonomic changes that signal emotion to other central sites. In either case, the cingulate and orbitofrontal cortex are important in linking emotional stimuli and autonomic changes to emotional stimuli, and the behavioural changes that follow such stimuli.

The difficulties quantifying and categorizing social behavioural changes in humans after cingulate lesions are apparent from the subtle behavioural changes observed by Tow and Whitty (1953). Two patients who read extensively in good literature before surgery subsequently read only sporadically and only 'poorer light magazines' and 'much less worth-while books.' One patient gave up carpentry, gardening and reading entirely. Both he and another patient lost all interest in sports and stopped attending soccer matches. Although difficult to measure, these are significant behavioural changes that relate to individual and social situations.

Anterior cingulate syndromes

Cingulate cortex seizures

Studies of anterior cingulate cortex seizures provide one of the most convincing bodies of evidence for the role of anterior cingulate cortex in motor function and affective behaviour. Cingulate cortex seizures can alter the level of attention or consciousness, voluntary and involuntary skeletomotor activity, affective expression, and autonomic activity. Cingulate seizures pose a challenge for epileptology, since surface recordings with scalp electrodes cannot detect ictal onsets in anterior cingulate cortex and invasive depth or subdural electrodes provide limited sampling (Quesney, 1986, 1992). Further, surface or invasive electrode recordings may reflect rapid contralateral or ipsilateral spread of seizure activity and fail to identify the true ictal onset (Saint-Hilaire, 1988; Quesney et al., 1992). Cingulate seizures may be misdiagnosed as a generalized seizure when the EEG reveals a generalized spike-and-slow wave discharge accompanied by staring with impaired responsiveness (absence seizure), head nod (atonic seizure) or convulsive movements (tonicclonic seizure) (Tükel and Jasper, 1952; Ralston, 1961; Mazars, 1970; Talairach et al., 1973; Levin and Duchwony, 1991). Despite the limitations and confusion associated with cingulate epilepsy, the pleomorphic features of anterior cingulate cortex seizures have been defined and can be used to characterize a cingulate epilepsy syndrome.

Clinical features

Seizures can begin at any age, but usually occur between the ages of 3 and 30 years (Mazars, 1970; Stoffels *et al.*, 1981; Levin and Duchowny, 1991). Available data suggest that manifestations of cingulate seizures may partly reflect the patient's age. Young children are more likely to stare and have mild atonia (e.g. head nod), while older children and adults are more likely to have complex behavioural features

(e.g. vocalizations and automatisms). Cingulate seizures tend to be frequent, brief, stereotyped, nocturnal, and lack a significant preictal or postictal phase. The clinical features of cingulate seizures may be divided as follows:

(*i*) Aura. Auras are often absent or are reported as nonspecific or autonomic symptoms. Dizziness, warmth, abdominal sensation, pallor, tachycardia, mydriasis, fear, feeling of suffocation, urge to void, forced urination, or apnea which can be voluntarily overcome have been reported (Penfield and Jasper, 1954; Talairach *et al.*, 1973; Geier *et al.*, 1975, 1977; Bancaud and Talairach, 1992).

(*ii*) Altered level of attention and consciousness. There may be an arrest of motor and verbal activity, staring which can mimic absence seizures but may be associated with a very brief postictal period (in contrast to absence seizures) and diminished or absent responsiveness (Mazars, 1970; Talairach *et al.*, 1973; Stoffels *et al.*, 1980, 1981; Levin and Duchowny, 1991). Although consciousness may be altered, patients may maintain contact with the environment and integrate stimuli into motor automatisms (*see* below, Bancaud and Talairach, 1992).

(*iii*) Tonic or clonic movements. Contralateral or bilateral tonic or clonic movements can occur in the extremities. Head deviation is usually contralateral to the ictal focus and may be accompanied by elevation of the contralateral arm suggesting spread to the ipsilateral cingulate motor areas and supplementary motor area (Mazars, 1970; Talairach *et al.*, 1973; Geier *et al.*, 1975, 1977; Bancaud *et al.*, 1976).

(*iv*) Sudden loss of muscle tone. Sudden loss of muscle tone has been reported, e.g. head nods (Mazars, 1970; Levin and Duchowny, 1991).

(v) Automatisms. Automatisms are often more complex and occur earlier than those during temporal lobe seizures. They may involve muscular activity of the following types: oral-alimentary (lipsmacking), facial (expression of fear, grimace, contortion, 'haggard eyes'), appendicular (touching hair or cloths, waving or hitting movements), truncal (turning the body, assuming the foetal position) or vocal (e.g. humming, unintelligible sounds, onomatopoieas, screaming, curses, brief phrases such as 'Oh my God,' laughing, crying, or moaning), or tongue (protrusion) (Escobedo et al., 1973; Talairach et al., 1973; Geier et al., 1977; Stoffels et al., 1980, 1981; Quesney, 1986; Sammaritano et al., 1993). In contrast to gestural automatisms in patients with temporal lobe epilepsy, several groups reported that some patients with automatisms during cingulate seizures can voluntarily inhibit or modify the motor behaviour to blend with ongoing activity (Talairach et al., 1973; Geier et al., 1977). In some cases, ictal or possibly postictal automatisms with aggressive

behaviours led to psychiatric hospitalization or imprisonment (Bancaud and Talairach, 1992).

Electrographic features

Interictal surface recordings may reveal normal background or diffuse or predominently frontal slowing. Bilateral isolated bursts of 1–4 Hz or slightly unilateral predominent spikeand-slow wave activity may be maximal over parasaggital, precentral or prefrontal regions. Interictal depth electrode recordings reveal similar epileptiform discharges which may arise symmetrically in both cingulate cortices spreading initially to the frontal convexities. Such spike-and-slow wave activity often leads on the side of clinical onset by ~60 ms (Mazars, 1970).

Ictal surface recordings reveal bilateral, symmetric, hypersynchronous, fast activity clinically associated with impaired consciousness, staring, speech arrest or head drop. Ictal depth recordings reveal background attenuation and low amplitude fast activity. Onset in anterior cingulate cortex was followed by nearly instantaneous bilateral spread. Onset in posterior cingulate cortex was followed several seconds later by contralateral spread and more often progressed to a tonicclonic seizure (Mazars, 1970). These differences between anterior and posterior cingulate cortices awaits confirmation.

Interictal behavioural changes

Among the series of patients with cingulate epilepsy, marked interictal behavioural abnormalities have been reported. In Mazars' (1970) report of 36 patients, the majority suffered from fixed or intermittent psychoses or episodic outbursts. The psychoses were clinically different from the ones accompanying temporal lobe epilepsy. Mazars noted that psychotic patients with cingulate epilepsy lacked the hypomania and logorrhea seen with the psychoses of temporal lobe epilepsy but had more paroxysmal aggressive outbursts and greater unsociability. Interestingly, such behaviours were often improved after bilateral cingulectomy. Ledesma and Paniagua (1969) also observed similar aggressive behaviours in epilepsy patients and improved aggression and epilepsy after bilateral cingulectomy.

One of the best documented and most fascinating cases of cingulate epilepsy was reported by Levin and Duchowny (1991). This 11-year-old girl had medically refractory seizures since the age of 2.5 years. Initially, her seizures were atonic, but later she developed complex partial seizures with impaired consciousness, eye blinking, and oroalimentary (e.g. lip smacking), vocal (e.g. humming), and gestural (e.g. hair fixing) automatisms. At the age of 3 years she developed obsessive features and by the age of 8 years she had pathological obsessive and compulsive symptoms. She was preoccupied with Satan and feared punishment for imagined and real behaviours, and she spent long periods at handwashing, toothbrushing and showers. Her CT and MRI studies were normal. Scalp video-EEG recordings showed partial

seizures arising from the right frontal region. Depth electrode recordings documented seizure onset from the right anterior cingulate cortex with secondary generalization of the 3–3.5 Hz spike-wave activity. Surgical destruction of 4 cm of right anterior cingulate cortex eliminated seizures and markedly reduced obsessive-compulsive behaviours during the first 15 post-operative months. Two additional cases, not previously reported, provide further insight into the features of seizures that originate in anterior cingulate cortex. Of note, both patients were followed by psychiatrists for many years with the diagnosis of non-epileptic psychogenic seizures.

Epilepsy Case 1

A 43-year-old man had a 15-year history of medically intractable complex partial seizures. Seizures initially occurred 3–20 times a week but increased to 10–20 seizures a day on presentation. The seizures were stereotyped, characterized by laughter, repetitions of the phrase 'Oh my God,' small repetitive neck and trunk flexion, and bilateral arm extension followed by repeated touching of the forehead and mouth. The duration of the seizures never exceeded 10 s and there was no pre- or post-ictal behavioural alterations. The patient was amnestic for the seizures. There were no risk factors for epilepsy. Because of the seizures, the patient lost a job of many years. He became more reclusive and returned to his parents' home.

Ictal recording with scalp and sphenoidal electrodes revealed rhythmic bifrontal theta. An FDG-PET scan was normal. A brain MRI revealed mild and diffuse cortical atrophy. An ictal SPECT scan showed increased blood flow to the right mesial frontal lobe. Depth electrodes were implanted in right and left orbitofrontal cortex with the long axis parallel to the gyrus rectus, ending anterior to the corpus callosum. Subdural strip electrodes were placed in the following locations: four along the right interhemispheric fissure and one along the left, with the distal contacts of two of the right interhemispheric strips and the left interhemispheric strip corresponding to anterior cingulate cortex; lateral frontal to orbitofrontal strips were placed bilaterally. Seizures arose as low amplitude fast activity consistently from electrodes recording from the right anterior cingulate cortex spreading within 250-500 ms to the left cingulate and right orbitofrontal cortices. The patient underwent a resection of the right anterior cingulum. Pathology revealed a low grade glioma. The patient's seizures have resolved over the first year of follow-up. He is living independently and has entered into a romantic relationship. He remains unemployed.

Epilepsy Case 2

A 42-year-old man had medically intractable complex partial seizures and sociopathic behaviour over 15 years beginning 1 year after a motorcycle accident associated with mild head trauma. Seizures were primarily nocturnal and as frequent as 10-20 a night, each lasting <1 min. Stereotyped behaviours



Fig. 5 Location of the intracranial electrodes in Seizure Case 2. Left and right frontal electrodes are depth electrodes; other electrodes are subdural strips.

included grotesque facial contortions, tongue thrusting, a strangulated yell, neck and trunk flexion, bilateral arm and leg extension with side-to-side thrashing and occasional progression to a generalized tonic-clonic seizure. There was no pre- or post-ictal phenomenon. Consciousness was preserved unless the seizure was secondary generalized. Behavioural abnormalities included excessive irritability, poor impulse control, and sexual preoccupation and deviancy. For example, he propositioned women medical staff and attempted to lick a nurse's face. He had been dismissed from the police force because of brutality, and then from the Drug Enforcement Agency because of brutality and use of confiscated drugs and was unemployed at the time of presentation. He was a black belt in karate and would strike out at anyone who attempted to restrain him during or after a seizure.

Ictal scalp and sphenoidal EEG showed rhythmic bifrontal theta. An FDG-PET scan was normal. A brain MRI showed a left parietal cryptic arteriovenous malformation. As shown in Fig. 5, intracranial electrodes were implanted including bilateral orbitofrontal depth electrodes with the long axis parallel to the gyrus rectus, ending anterior to the corpus callosum; two subdural electrodes in the right interhemispheric fissure and two in the left, with distal contacts corresponding to anterior cingulate cortex; and bilateral lateral-frontal to orbitofrontal subdural strip electrodes. A subdural strip was also placed adjacent to the cryptic arterovenous malformation. All seizures arose from the right cingulate gyrus, as shown in Fig. 6. Spread to contralateral anterior cingulate cortex and to ipsilateral orbitofrontal cortex occurred within 300 ms. He underwent resection of the right cingulate gyrus and an anterior corpus

callosotomy. He has experienced more than a 90% reduction in seizures. The residual seizures are characterized only by brief axial flexion. Family members also describe behavioural improvement with diminished irritability and better social conduct. He is now employed as a manager at a fast-food restaurant and has married his girlfriend of many years, assuming the care of her three children.

Cingulate epilepsy syndrome

Although recognition remains elusive and documentation challenging, these patients express a spectrum of features associated with anterior cingulate cortex seizures. The extensive sampling of frontal cortex allowed onset to be precisely localized to the anterior cingulate cortex. The variability in ictal behaviours probably reflects different spread patterns. These seizures often include changes in level of attention or consciousness, activity in autonomic and skeletomotor systems, automatisms which occur early in the seizure and may be suppressed or modified voluntarily. Cingulate seizures are often frequent, under 45 s in duration, stereotypic, and include prominent affective vocalization, axial flexion, appendicular extension, facial contortion, and gestural automatisms. In some seizures, consciousness is maintained despite bilateral motor involvement. Patients with cingulate seizures may be diagnosed with psychogenic seizures. A non-epileptic diagnosis may be prompted by the significant behavioural abnormalities exhibited interictally and because of subtle or no alteration in the pre- and postictal states.

In many patients, even those with only neuronal loss documented pathologically in anterior cingulate cortex,



Fig. 6 EEG obtained from electrodes surgical implanted in right frontal lobe of Seizure Case 2. RD/LD = right/left depth electrode; RM/LM = right/left mid interhemispheric fissure (*see* Fig. 2). Contact point 1 is most distant from the point of entry. Contacts 1, 2 and 3 of RM record from the right cingulate gyrus. The seizure begins at the arrow, with low amplitude fast (>15 Hz) activity.

prominent interictal behaviour changes occur. These behavioural changes contrast markedly with those reported in patients who have undergone bilateral cingulectomy. Indeed, many patients with such behavioural changes reported in the earlier literature (Mazars, 1970) as well as more recently (Levin and Duchowny, 1991) and here (Case 2), the behaviours improved after unilateral or bilateral cingulectomy. These behaviours may, therefore, result from some pathological amplification of cingulate activity, perhaps reflecting abberent connections between affects, ideas, and actions.

Akinetic mutism and cingulate strokes

Akinetic mutism is a condition in which the subject appears to be awake and to visually track objects without spontaneous motor and verbal responses (Cairns *et al.*, 1941). Akinetic mutism occurs with bilateral cingulate and adjacent frontal cortical lesions as well as with lesions of the paramedian reticular formation in the midbrain and diencephalon (Cravioto *et al.*, 1960; Kemper and Romanul, 1967; Skultety, 1968). There are no reports in animals or in humans with neurosurgically produced or spontaneous lesions limited to the cingulate gyri in which either akinesia or mutism persisted more than a few days. In the case of transient deficits, it is impossible to exclude injury to neighbouring cortical areas or white matter.

Akinetic mutism is most often associated with bilateral anterior cingulate cortex lesions. One young alcoholic man developed akinetic mutism after bilateral anterior cerebral artery infarcts with maximal destruction in area 24 (Amyes and Nielsen, 1953). The lesion, however, extended to the corpus callosum and left frontal pole. He was eventually able to feed himself on occasion and respond to questions with yes/no answers. Another akinetic mute man had bilateral haemorrhagic lesions in area 24. He was unresponsive to noxious stimuli, incontinent of urine and lay with his eyes open, unable to swallow food or drink (Barris and Schuman, 1953). The lesion involved contiguous cortical areas including medial and inferior portions of areas 4 and 6, and slight involvement of area 32. Old lesions, consistent with previous head trauma, were in both orbitofrontal areas and the inferior surface of the left temporal lobe. Other cases of akinetic mutism with bicingulate lesions resulting from rupture of anterior cerebral artery aneurysms, strokes in the territory of the anterior cerebral artery, or tumours have been reported (Faris, 1969; Buge et al., 1975; Laplane et al., 1981; Nemeth et al., 1988). In all cases, the lesions were maximal in anterior cingulate cortex, but extended to other regions of the frontal, and in some cases, other cortical and subcortical regions.

The most severe deficits in spontaneity and motor activation probably follow bilateral lesions of anterior cingulate cortex and the supplementary motor area. Laplane *et al.*'s case (1981) is remarkable because there was extensive bilateral anterior cingulate (and fornix) damage with indifference,

docility, amnesia and prominent inattention, but motor activity was normal (i.e. no akinesia or mutism). These investigators suggest that the preservation of motor activity was related to sparing of the supplementary motor area and caudal anterior cingulate cortex. As animal studies have shown, the caudal cingulate area 23c contains a motor area. Neuropsychological, metabolic, and clinical studies document the role of the supplementary motor area in preparing and initiating movement (Laplane et al., 1977; Deecke and Kornhuber, 1978; Orgogozo and Larsen, 1979; Roland et al., 1980; Verfaellie and Heilman, 1987). In many clinical cases, lesions encompassed both anterior cingulate cortex and supplementary motor area (Laplane et al., 1977; Verfaellie and Heilman, 1987). Unilateral neurosurgical resections of the supplementary motor area cause only transient mutism or contralateral hemiplegia (Laplane et al., 1977). The motor defect in these patients improves to a point where there is slight hesitation during rapid alternating movements, lack of fluidity in contralateral movements and speech in the case of dominant hemisphere lesions (Laplane et al., 1977). The reciprocal connections between anterior cingulate cortex and supplementary motor area may in part explain why unilateral supplementary motor area lesions can cause transient mutism or transcortical motor aphasia (Laplane et al., 1977; Masdeu et al., 1978; Brust et al., 1982; Rubens and Kertesz, 1983). In many cases with supplementary motor area lesions and reduced vocalization, there was also cingulate injury. Both the supplementary motor area and anterior cingulate cortex may activate vocalization, especially when responding to an emotional stimulus.

Damasio and Van Hoesen (1983) report a 35-year-old woman with a left cingulate and supplementary motor area embolic infarct. Initially, she had no spontaneous speech but was able to repeat. She made no response to questions but did not appear frustrated. One month later, after a significant recovery, she commented that 'she did not talk because she had nothing to say.' Her mind was 'empty'. 'Nothing mattered.' During the initial illness she could follow the doctors conversations, but 'felt no will to reply' to the questions. They interpret the findings in this and other cases of combined cingulate and supplementary motor area damage to indicate that such lesions cause a profound behavioural disturbance, preventing the normal expression and experience of affect.

Both anterior cingulate cortex and supplementary motor area receive dopaminergic input from the ventral tegmental area (Ungerstedt, 1971). Akinesia can result from specific anatomical or neurochemical lesions: destruction of the ascending forebrain dopaminergic fibres or drugs decreasing dopaminergic activity (e.g. receptor blockers like phenothiazines), depleting storage (reserpine) or blocking synthesis (alpha-methylparatyrosine) (DeLong and Georgopoulos, 1981). Dopaminergic agonists can improve akinesia and mutism when there are lesions of the ascending dopaminergic fibres and limbic regions are intact (Ross and Stewart, 1981) but not when the lesions include the areas where these fibres terminate (e.g. cingulate, orbitofrontal and septal areas) (Devinsky et al., 1987).

In summary, isolated bilateral cingulate damage or supplementary motor area damage does not cause persistent akinesia or mutism. However, when lesions involve both of these areas or one of these areas together with other pathways or areas involved in motor activation, akinesia and mutism can occur and may be permanent.

Gilles de la Tourette Syndrome

Gilles de la Tourette Syndrome (GTS) is a chronic motor and vocal tic disorder associated with obsessive thoughts and compulsive behaviours, sleep disorders, echolalia, and echopraxia. Obsessions and compulsions affect the majority of patients (Eldridge *et al.*, 1977; Cummings and Frankel, 1985). Obtrusive sexual and aggressive thoughts and actions are common, as are other obsessive-compulsive behaviours such as touching specific objects or people, hand-washing, ritualistic behaviours, fears about failure to lock doors, and ego-alien intrusive thoughts.

A biological basis for GTS is widely supported from genetic, biochemical, neuropharmacological and electrophysiological studies (Bulter *et al.*, 1979; Cohen *et al.*, 1979; Nee *et al.*, 1980; Obeso *et al.*, 1981; Pauls and Leckman, 1986). The pathogenesis and anatomical basis of GTS, however, remains unknown. Neuropathological studies have generally been unrevealing (Dewulf and van Bogaert, 1941; Balthasar, 1957), although diminished or absent dynorphinlike staining in the globus pallidus was found in one case (Haber *et al.*, 1986).

A potential role of the anterior cingulate cortex in GTS (Devinsky, 1983) was suggested because: (i) electrical stimulation of the anterior cingulate gyrus in monkeys evokes guttural sounds and calls (Robinson, 1967; Jürgens and Ploog, 1970); (ii) connections between the anterior cingulate cortex and structures are involved in vocalization (Müller-Preuss and Jürgens, 1976; Baleydier and Mauguiere, 1980); (iii) there is a a dopaminergic pathway from the ventral tegmental area to anterior cingulate cortex and dopaminergic hyperactivity is postulated as the principal neurochemical abnormality in GTS (Singer, et al., 1982; Devinsky, 1983); (iv) there are similarities between complex, coordinated movement patterns evoked by electrical stimulation of the anterior cingulate cortex in humans and those observed during tics; (v) a 15% decrease in cerebral glucose utilization in the anterior cingulate cortex and insular cortices is observed in patients with GTS (Chase et al., 1986); and (vi) lesions of anterior cingulate cortex or the cingulum bundle can relieve obsessive-compulsive behaviours (Ballantine et al., 1987). Furthermore, several groups have found that cingulumotomy reduced obsessive-compulsive behaviours in GTS patients (Baker, 1962; Kurlan et al., 1988; Robertson et al., 1990). The intralaminar and medial thalamic nuclei have also been neurosurgically ablated with reduction in tics and obsessivecompulsive behaviours in GTS (Hassler and Dieckmann,

1970; de Devitiis *et al.*, 1977). These thalamic areas have strong connections to anterior cingulate cortex as noted previously. Notably, Rauch *et al.* (1994) found increased regional cerebral blood flow in the right caudate, left anterior cingulate cortex and bilateral orbitofrontal regions during obsessive-compulsive syptoms.

The unique clinical aspects of GTS may derive from the unique contributions of anterior cingulate cortex to behaviour. It is one of the only neurological disorders in which simply thinking about a symptom-the tic-can evoke it. The patient who sees an obese person and uncontrollably vocalizes loudly 'fat fat lady' as a verbal tic may have cingulate dysfunction. The integration of thought, motivation and emotion with movement are critical aspects of cingulate function. In GTS, anterior cingulate cortex may discharge autonomously without the control of other areas such as prefrontal cortex which may be capable of inhibiting cingulate function (Cohen et al., 1988). Whereas many people may pass an obese individual and make note of their distinctive morphology with an internal verbalization, the GTS patient lacks conscious control of the motor act. In other instances, they can consciously suppress the tic at the cost of hightened emotional tension. This semi-volitional component is reminiscent of motor acts observed during cingulate seizures and with electical stimulation of anterior cingulate cortex.

Psychiatric disorders Effects of cingulectomy

Surgical removal of the anterior cingulate gyri for treatment of psychiatric disorders began in the late 1940s (Ward, 1948b; Mettler *et al.*, 1949; Scoville, 1949; LeBeau and Pecker, 1950). Whitty *et al.* (1952) reported 29 cases with bilateral ablations limited to area 24. During the initial post-operative period, patients made small, repetitive, seemingly purposeless movements such as patting the bedclothes or rubbing the face. There was often a transient reduction of aggression and tension in patients with psychosis. In contrast, patients with obsessive-compulsive disorder and anxiety neurosis enjoyed a long-lasting improvement in these disorders with minimal undesirable personality changes. LeBeau (1954) partially removed area 24 bilaterally in patients with epilepsy and aggression or psychosis, reporting behavioural improvement in most cases.

Tow and Whitty (1953) reported eight cases with bilateral area 24 ablations for depression, anxiety, and obsessive– compulsive disorder. Psychiatric symptoms, especially anxiety and obsessiveness were significantly improved, and there was little change in personality. Some subjects were, however, unduly tired in the afternoon, less meticulous in their habits, slower in thoughts and actions, less self-conscious and timid, more irritable, had shallower and less sustained affect, and had impaired judgment in personal and social situations. There were no changes in memory, religious thought, sexual desire or humour. Subsequent studies confirmed that cingulectomy reduces aggression and affective range and relieves chronic pain (Jimeno and Paniagua, 1969; Wilson and Chang, 1974). No post-cingulectomy deterioration in cognition or personality has been found using the Wechsler Adult Intelligence Scale, Halstead–Reitan Test Battery, Wechsler Memory Scale, Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory (Long *et al.*, 1978). The only significant change was a decrease in anxiety.

Schizophrenia

Several lines of evidence suggest that structural, neurochemical and physiological disorders of the anterior cingulate cortex, as well as other areas such as the hippocampus and dorsolateral frontal cortex, are involved in the pathogenesis of schizophrenia (Benes, 1993). Post-mortem studies reveal a significant reduction in the number of small neurons (interneurons) throughout the anterior cingulate cortex in schizophrenic brains, with the changes maximal in layer II (Benes *et al.*, 1991). These structural changes were not related to age or treatment variables.

Post-mortem studies suggest a selective loss of glutamatergic neurons and altered GABA-A binding on pyramidal cells in the superficial layers of the anterior cingulate cortex in schizophrenics. Benes et al. (1992a) found increased biccuculine-sensitive and [3H]muscimol binding to GABA-A receptors on neuronal cell bodies in anterior cingulate cortex layers II and III and the neuropil in layer I. These changes did not appear to result from antipsychotic medication exposure as similar findings were present in one drug naive patient and in another patient exposed to only small doses of such medications. Benes et al. (1992b) also found significantly increased density of small-calibre (78%) and large-calibre (30%) glutamate-immunoreactive vertical fibres in anterior cingulate cortex layers II and IIIa of schizophrenic brains when compared to age-matched controls. Flunitrazepam binding is reduced in the anterior cingulate cortex and hippocampus of post-mortem schizophrenic brains, suggesting a loss of glutamatergic neurons (Squires et al., 1993). These post-mortem studies suggest a disturbance of inhibitory activity in these superficial layers of the anterior cingulate cortex.

Metabolic, blood flow and receptor-labelling studies also implicate anterior cingulate cortex dysfunction in schizophrenia. Patients with schizophrenia have significantly lower regional cerebral metabolic rate of glucose in the hippocampus and anterior cingulate cortex (Tamminga *et al.*, 1992). During the Wisconsin Card Sorting Test (which assesses shifting behavioural sets), schizophrenic patients, but not normal controls, had reduced regional cerebral blood flow in the medial frontal regions (Kawasaki *et al.*, 1993). Behavioural tasks that increase anterior cingulate cortex blood flow in normals (i.e. Tower of London) do not activate this cortex in neuroleptic-naive or non-naive schizophrenic patients (Andreasen *et al.*, 1992).

Conclusions

The anterior cingulate cortex may be essential in making a transition from early premotor to behavioural states. The clinical and experimental observations reviewed here suggest that anterior cingulate cortex subserves three levels of premotor processing. First, when a response selection is to be made, including the decision not to move, area 24' is engaged, while attending to non-challenging sensory stimuli such as different frequency tones or neutral visual stimuli may be associated with reduced activity in these areas. Secondly, the expression of specific movement sequences that require little or no autonomic activity is probably directed by the CMAs in the depths of the cingulate sulcus. Finally, when autonomic activity is required there may be coactivation of visceromotor and skeletomotor areas in anterior cingulate cortex.

One consequence of these generalizations is that anterior cingulate cortex and its connections provide mechanisms by which affect and intellect can be joined. The cingulate gyrus may be viewed as both an amplifier and filter, interconnecting the emotional and cognitive components of the mind. Under normal conditions, behavioural responses such as vocalization in response to emotional stimuli are facilitated through circuits in anterior cingulate cortex and the adjacent supplementary motor area. Similarly, affective states are in part modulated by anterior cingulate cortex. Thus, after bicingulate lesions, a noxious stimulus may still be localized on the body surface, but will not trigger the unpleasant affective pain perception and avoidance responses that normally occur. The anterior cingulate cortex may also be responsible for activating circuits associated with emotional states (e.g. 'getting psyched') in response to intellectual ideas such as going to a sporting event. Obsessive-compulsive disorder, pathological anxiety, and behavioural problems associated with cingulate epilepsy (i.e. intermittent and fixed psychoses, disordered impulse control and aggression, irritability, obsessions and compulsions, and sexual preoccupation) may, in part, be a disorder of excessive amplification of emotional signals. Tics and impulsive movements may reflect pathological amplification of spontaneous motor behaviour. The diminished motivation, lethargy, loss of interest in reading and sports, and decreased affective range after cingulate lesions also may reflect diminished amplification of emotional willpower.

Most of the dramatic behavioural changes following anterior cingulate cortex lesions are associated with other lesions. Thus, when combined with orbitofrontal lesions, a devastating 'social agnosia' results. When combined with supplementary motor area lesions, akinesia and mutism result. One may speculate that the combination of lesions in the anterior cingulate cortex and other areas may cause severe neurobehavioural disorders such as schizophrenia. For example, impairment of willed actions (anterior cingulate cortex and dorsolateral prefrontal cortex), attention to action (anterior cingulate cortex and dorsolateral frontal and/or parietal cortex), memory (anterior cingulate cortex and septum or hippocampus). The functions of the anterior cingulate cortex, a component of several vital networks and subserving a diverse range of functions, are difficult to quantify or even describe, and have eluded the traditional 'localized lesion-behavioural correlate' approach. Understanding the anterior cingulate cortex may require new methodologies and new frames of reference. One such perspective is that of the rostral limbic system. This concept proposes that a select group of forebrain structures including anterior cingulate cortex are involved in affect and regulating context-relevant motor behaviours. Each part of the rostral limbic system has direct access to autonomic and skeletomotor brainstem systems for implementing behaviour.

References

Aggleton JP. The amygdala: neurobiological aspects of emotion, memory, and mental dysfunction. New York: Wiley-Liss, 1992.

Aitken PG. Cortical control of conditioned and spontaneous vocal behavior in rhesus monkeys. Brain Lang 1981; 13: 171–84.

Amyes EW, Nielsen JM. Bilateral anterior cingulate gyrus lesions. Bull Los Angeles Neurol Soc 1953; 18: 48–51.

Andreasen NC, Rezai K, Alliger R, Swayze VW 2d, Flaum M, Kirchner P, et al. Hypofrontality in neuroleptic-naive patients and in patients with chronic schizophrenia. Assessment with xenon 133 single-photon emission computed tomography and the Tower of London. Arch Gen Psychiatry 1992; 49: 943–58.

Angelini L, Mazzucchi A, Picciotto F, Nardocci N, Broggi G. Focal lesion of the right cingulum: a case report in a child. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 1981; 44: 355–7.

Aosaki T, Tsubokawa H, Ishida A, Watanabe K, Graybiel AM, Kimura M. Responses of tonically active neurons in the primate's striatum undergo systematic changes during behavioral sensorimotor conditioning. J Neurosci 1994; 14: 3969–84.

Baker EFW. Gilles de la Tourette syndrome treated by bimedial frontal leucotomy. Can Med Assoc J 1962; 86: 746–7.

Baleydier C, Mauguiere F. The duality of the cingulate gyrus in monkey: neuroanatomical study and functional hypothesis. Brain 1980; 103: 525–54.

Ballantine HT, Cassidy WL, Flanagan NB, Marino R. Stereotaxic anterior cingulotomy for neuropsychiatric illness and intractable pain. J Neurosurg 1967; 26: 488–95.

Ballantine HT Jr, Bouckoms AJ, Thomas EK, Giriunas IE. Treatment of psychiatric illness by stereotactic cingulotomy. Biol Psychiatry 1987; 22: 807–17.

Balthasar K. Über das anatomische Substrat der generalisierten Tic-Krankheit (maladie des tics, Gilles de la Tourette): Entwicklungshemmung des corpus striatum. Arch Psychiat Berl, 1957; 195: 531-49.

Bancaud J, Talairach J. Clinical semiology of frontal lobe seizures. Adv Neurol 1992; 57: 3-58.

Bancaud J, Talairach J, Geier S, Bonis A, Trottier S, Manrique

M. Manifestations comportementales induites par la stimulation électrique du gyrus cingulaire antérieur chez l'homme. Rev Neurol 1976 (Paris); 132: 705–24.

Bandler R, Carrive P, Zhang SP. Integration of somatic and autonomic reactions within the midbrain periaqueductal grey: viscerotopic, somatotopic and functional organization. [Review]. Prog Brain Res 1991; 87: 269-305.

Barbas H, Pandya DN. Architecture and intrinsic connections of the prefrontal cortex in the rhesus monkey. J Comp Neurol 1989; 286: 353–75.

Barris RW, Schuman HR. Bilateral anterior cingulate gyrus lesions: syndrome of the anterior cingulate gyri. Neurology 1953; 3: 44-52.

Bates JF, Goldman-Rakic PS. Prefrontal connections of medial motor areas in the rhesus monkey. J Comp Neurol 1993; 335: 211-28.

Bench CJ, Friston KJ, Brown RG, Scott LC, Frackowiak RSJ, Dolan RJ. The anatomy of melancholia—focal abnormalities of cerebral blood flow in major depression. Psychol Med 1992; 22: 607–15.

Benes FM. Neurobiological investigations in cingulate cortex of schizophrenic brain. [Review]. Schizophr Bull 1993; 19: 537-49.

Benes FM, McSparren J, Bird ED, SanGiovanni JP, Vincent SL. Deficits in small interneurons in prefrontal and cingulate cortices of schizophrenic and schizoaffective patients. Arch Gen Psychiatry 1991; 48: 996–1001.

Benes FM, Vincent SL, Alsterberg G, Bird ED, SanGiovanni JP. Increased GABA-A receptor binding in superficial layers of cingulate cortex in schizophrenics. J Neurosci 1992a; 12: 924–9.

Benes FM, Sorensen I, Vincent SL, Bird ED, Sathi M. Increased density of glutamate-immunoreactive vertical processes in superficial laminae in cingulate cortex of schizophrenic brain. Cerebr Cortex 1992b; 2: 503–12.

Bentivoglio M, Kultas-Ilinsky K, Ilinsky I. Limbic thalamus: structure, intrinsic organization and connections. In: Vogt BA, Gabriel M, editors. Neurobiology of cingulate cortex and limbic thalamus: a comprehensive handbook. Boston: Birkhäuser, 1993: 71–122

Biber MP, Kneisley LW, LaVail JH. Cortical neurons projecting to the cervical and lumbar enlargments of the spinal cord in young and adult rhesus monkeys. Exp Neurol 1978; 59: 492–508.

Braak H. A primitive gigantopyramidal field buried in the depth of the cingulate sulcus of the human brain. Brain Res 1976; 109: 219–33.

Braak H. Pigment architecture of the human telencephalic cortex. V. Regio anterogenualis. Cell Tiss Res 1979; 204: 441–451.

Broca P. Anatomie comparée des circonvolutions cérébrales: le grand lobe limbique et le scissure limbique dans la série des mammifères. Rev d'Anthrop Par 1878; 3.s., i: 385–498.

Brodal A. Neurological anatomy in relation to clinical medicine. 3rd ed. Oxford University Press: New York, 1981: 869.

Brodmann K. Vergleichende Lokalisationslehre der Grosshirnrinde in ihren Prinzipien dargestellt auf Grund des Zellenbaues. Leipzig: Barth, 1909.

300 O. Devinsky et al.

Brown MH, Lighthill JA. Selective anterior cingulotomy: a psychosurgical evaluation. 1968; 29: 513–19.

Brown S, Schäfer EA. An investigation into the functions of the occipital and temporal lobes of the monkey's brain. Philos Trans R Soc Lond, 1888; 179: 303–27.

Brust JCM, Plank C, Burke A, Guobadia MMI, Healton EB. Language disorder in a right-hander after occlusion of the right anterior cerebral artery. Neurology 1982; 32: 492–7.

Buchanan SL, Powell DA. Cingulate damage attenuates conditioned bradycardia. Neurosci Lett 1982; 29: 261-8.

Buchanan SL, Powell DA. Cingulothalamic and prefrontal control of autonomic function. In: Vogt BA, Gabriel M, editors. Neurobiology of cingulate cortex and limbic thalamus: a comprehensive handbook. Boston: Birkhäuser, 1993; 381–414.

Buge A, Escourolle R, Rancurel G, Poisson M. 'Mutism akinétique' et ramollissement bicingulaire. Rev Neurol (Paris) 1975; 131: 121–37.

Butler IJ, Koslow SH, Seifert WE Jr, Caprioli RM, Singer HS. Biogenic amine metabolism in Tourette sundrome. Ann Neurol 1979; 6: 37–9.

Caceres A, Taleisnik S. Blockade of ovulation and release of LH in the rat by electrochemical stimulation of the frontal lobe cortex. Brain Res 1980; 188: 411–23

Cairns H, Oldfield RC, Pennybacker JB, Whitteridge D. Akinetic mutism with an epidermoid cyst of the 3rd ventricle. Brain 1941; 64: 273–90.

Casey KL. Unit analysis of nociceptive mechanisms in the thalamus of the awake squirrel monkey. J Neurophysiol 1966; 29: 727–50.

Casey KL, Minoshima S, Berger KL, Koeppe RA, Morrow TJ, Frey KA. Positron emission tomographic analysis of cerebral structures activated specifically by repetitive noxious heat stimuli. J Neurophysiol 1994; 71: 802–7.

Chase TN, Geoffrey V, Gillespie M, Burrows GH. Structural and functional studies of Gilles de la Tourette syndrome. Rev Neurol (Paris) 1986; 142: 851–5.

Cheney PD, Fetz EE, Mewes K. Neural mechanisms underlying corticospinal and rubrospinal control of limb movements. [Review]. Prog Brain Res 1991; 87: 213–52.

Cohen DJ, Shaywitz BA, Young JG, Carbonari CM, Nathanson JA, Lieberman D, et al. Central biogenic amine metabolism in children with the syndrome of chronic multiple tics of Gilles de la Tourette: norepinephrine, serotonin, and dopamine. J Am Acad Child Psychiatry 1979; 18: 320–41.

Cohen RM, Semple WE, Gross M, Holcomb HH, Dowling MS. Nordahl TE. Functional localization of sustained attention: comparison to sensory stimulation in the absence of instruction. Neuropyschiatry Neuropsychol Behav Neurol 1988; 1: 3–20.

Corbett D, Stellar JR. Neurological reactivity during medial prefrontal cortex stimulation: effects of self-stimulation experience. Physiol Behav 1983; 31: 771–6.

Corbett D, Laferriere A, Milner PM. Plasticity of the medial prefrontal cortex: facilitated acquisition of intracranial self-

stimulation by pretraining stimulation. Physiol Behav 1982; 28: 531–4.

Corbetta M, Miezin FM, Dobmeyer S, Shulman GL, Petersen SE. Selective and divided attention during visual disriminations of shape, color, and speed: functional anatomy by positron emission tomography J Neurosci 1991; 11: 2383–402

Corkin S, Twitchell TE, Sullivan EV. Safety and efficacy of cingulotomy for pain and psychiatric disorders. In: Hitchcock ER, Ballantine HT, Meyerson BA, editors. Modern concepts in psychiatric surgery. New York: Elseveir, 1979: 253–72.

Cravioto H, Silberman J, Feigin I. A clinical and pathologic study of akinetic mutism. Neurology 1960; 10: 10–21.

Cummings JL, Frankel M. Gilles de la Tourette syndrome and the neurological basis of obsessions and compulsions. Biol Psychiatry 1985; 20: 117–26.

Damasio AR, Van Hoesen GW. Focal lesions of the limbic frontal lobe. In: Heilman KM, Satz P, editors. Neuropsychology of human emotion. New York: Guilford Press, 1983, 85–110.

Damasio AR, Tranel D, Damasio H. Individuals with sociopathic behavior caused by frontal damage fail to respond autonomically to social stimuli. Behav Brain Res 1990; 41: 81–94.

de Devitiis E, D'Errico A, Cerillo A. Stereotactic surgery in Gilles de la Tourette syndrome. Acta Neurochir (Wien) 1977; Suppl 24: 73.

Deecke L, Kornhuber HH. An electrical sign of participation of the mesial 'supplementary' motor cortex in human voluntary finger movement. Brain Res 1978; 159: 473–6.

DeLong MR, Georgopoulos AP. Motor functions of the basal ganglia. In: Brookhart JM, Mountcastle VB, Brooks VB, editors. Handbook of physiology, Sect 1, Vol. 2, Pt 2. Bethesda (MD): American Physiological Society, 1981: 1017–61.

Derbyshire SWG, Jones AKP, Devani P, Friston KJ, Feinmann C, Harris M, et al. Cerebral responses to pain in patients with atypical facial pain measured by positron emission tomography. In press.

Devinsky O. Neuroanatomy of Gilles de la Tourette's syndrome. Possible midbrain involvement. [Review]. Arch Neurol 1983; 40: 508–14.

Devinsky O, Lemann W, Evans AC, Moeller JR, Rottenberg DA. Akinetic mutism in a bone marrow transplant recipient following total-body irradiation and amphotericin B chemoprophylaxis: a positron emission tomographic and neuropathologic study. Arch Neurol 1987; 44: 414–17.

Dewulf A, van Bogaert L. Etudes anatomo-clinique de syndrômes hypercinétiques complexes: III. Une oberservation anatamo-clinique de maladie des tics (Gilles de la Tourette). Monatschr Psychiat Neurol 1941; 104: 53–61.

Dong WK, Ryu H, Wagman IH. Nociceptive responses of neurons in medial thalamus and their relationship to spinothalamic pathways. J Neurophysiol 1978; 41: 1592–613.

Douglin DC, Glassman RB. Gradual increase in self-stimulation response rates: effect of electrode loci. Physiol Psychol 1979; 7: 135–8.

Dua S, MacLean PD. Localization for penile erection in medial frontal lobe. Am J Physiol 1964; 207: 1425-34.

Dum RP, Strick PL. The origin of corticospinal projections from the premotor areas in the frontal lobe. J Neurosci 1991; 11: 667–89.

Dum RP, Strick PL. The cingulate motor areas. In: Vogt BA, Gabriel M, editors. Neurobiology of cingulate cortex and limbic thalamus: a comprehensive handbook. Boston: Birkhäuser, 1993, 415–41.

Dunn JD. Plasma corticosterone responses to electrical stimulation of the medial frontal cortex. Neurosci Res Commun 1990; 7: 1–7.

Eldridge R, Sweet R, Lake CR, Ziegler M, Shapiro AK. Gilles de la Tourette's syndrome: clinical, genetic, psychologic, and biochemical aspects in 21 selected families. Neurology 1977; 27: 115–24.

Elliott FA. The corpus callosum, cingulate gyrus, septum pellucidum, spetal area and fornix. In: Vinken PJ, Bruyn GW, editors. Handbook of clinical neurology, Vol. 2. North-Holland: Amsterdam, 1969: 758–5.

Escobedo F, Fernández-Guardiola A, Solis G. Chronic stimulation of the cingulum in humans with behavior disorders. In: Laitinen LV, Livingston KE, editors. Surgical Approaches in psychiatry. Lancaster (UK): MTP, 1973: 65–8.

Eslinger PJ, Damasio AR. Severe disturbance of higher cognition after bilateral frontal lobe ablation: patient EVR. Neurology 1985; 35: 1731–41.

Faris AA. Limbic system infarction. Neurology 1969; 19: 91-6.

Fazio F, Perani D, Gilardi MC, Colombo F, Cappa SF, Vallar G, et al. Metabolic impairment in human amnesia: a PET study of memory networks. J Cereb Blood Flow Metab 1992; 12: 353–8.

Foltz EL, White LE. Pain 'relief' by frontal cingulumotomy. J Neurosurg 1962; 19: 89-100.

Frazier CH. Tumor involving the frontal lobe alone: a symptomatic study of one hundred and five verified cases. Arch Neurol Psychiatry 1936; 35: 525–71.

Frith CD, Friston K, Liddle PF, Frackowiak RSJ. A PET study of word finding. Neuropsychologia 1991a; 29: 1137–48.

Frith CD, Friston K, Liddle PF, Frackowiak RSJ. Willed action and the prefrontal cortex in man: a study with PET. Proc R Soc Lond Biol 1991b; 244: 241–6.

Frysztak RJ, Neafsey EJ. The effect of medial frontal cortex lesions on respiration, 'freezing,' and ultrasonic vocalizations during conditioned emotional responses in rats. Cereb Cortex 1991; 1: 418–25.

Gabriel M. Discriminative avoidance learning: a model system. In: Vogt BA, Gabriel M, editors. Neurobiology of cingulate cortex and limbic thalamus: a comprehensive handbook. 1993; Boston: Birkhauser, 1993: 478–523.

Gabriel M, Sparenborg SP, Kubota Y. Anterior and medial thalamic lesions, discriminative avoidance learning, and cingulate cortical neuronal activity in rabbits. Exp Brain Res 1989; 76: 441–57.

Gabriel M, Kubota Y, Sparenborg S, Straube K, Vogt BA. Effects of cingulate cortical lesions on avoidance learning, and traininginduced unit activity in rabbits. Exp Brain Res 1991; 86: 585–600.

Gautier-Smith PC. Parasagittal and falx meningiomas. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1970.

Geier S, Bancaud J, Talairach J, Bonis A, Szikla G, Enjelvin M. Clinical note: clinical and tele-stereo-EEG findings in a patient with psychomotor seizures. Epilepsia 1975; 16: 119–25.

Geier S, Bancaud J, Talairach J, Bonis A, Szikla G, Enjelvin M. The seizures of frontal lobe epilepsy. A study of clinical manifestations. Neurology 1977; 27: 951–8.

George MS, Ketter TA, Gill DS, Haxby JV, Ungerleider LG, Herscovitch P, et al. Brain regions involved in recognizing facial emotion or identity: an oxygen-15 PET study. J Neuropsychiatry Clin Neurosci 1993; 5: 384–94.

George MS, Ketter TA, Parekh PI Rosinksy N, Ring H, Casey BJ, et al. Regional brain activity when selecting a response despite interference: an $H_2^{15}O$ PET study of the Stroop and an emotional Stroop. Hum Brain Mapping 1994a; 1: 194–209.

George MS, Ketter TA, Parekh PI, et al. Regional brain activity during transient self-induced sadness or happiness in healthy women. Am J Psychiatry 1994b. In press.

Gibbs CM, Powell DA. Single-unit activity in the dorsomedial prefrontal cortex during the expression of discriminative bradycardia in rabbits. Behav Brain Res 1991; 43: 79–92.

Glees P, Cole J, Whitty CWM, Cairns H. The effects of lesions in the cingular gyrus and adjacent areas in monkeys. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 1950; 13: 178–90.

Goddard GV, McIntyre DC, Leech CK. A permanent change in brain function resulting from daily electrical stimulation. Exp Neurol 1969; 25: 295–330.

Goldberg G. Supplementary motor area structure and function: review and hypotheses. Behav Brain Sci 1985; 8: 567–616.

Gomez JA, Mettler FA. Effect of bilateral anterior cingulate damage in cats. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 1962; 25: 387–91.

Goodall EB, Carey RJ. Effects of d- versus l-amphetamine, food deprivation, and current intensity on self-stimulation of the lateral hypothalamus, substantia nigra, and medial frontal cortex of the rat. J Comp Physiol Psychol 1975; 89: 1029–45.

Grasby PM, Frith CD, Friston KJ, Bench C, Frackowiak RSJ, Dolan RJ. Functional mapping of brain areas implicated in auditory-verbal memory function. Brain 1993; 116: 1-20.

Grossman M, Crino P, Reivich M, Stern MB, Hurtig HI. Attention and sentence processing deficits in Parkinson's disease: the role of anterior cingulate cortex. Cereb Cortex 1992; 2: 513–25.

Haber SN, Kowall NW, Vonsattel JP, Bird ED, Richardson EP Jr. Gilles de la Tourette's syndrome: a postmortem neuropathological and immunohistochemical study. J Neurol Sci 1986; 75: 225-41.

Halgren E, Walter RD, Cherlow DG, Crandall PH. Mental phenomena evoked by electrical stimulation of the human hippocampal formation and amygdala. Brain 1978; 101: 83–117.

Hardy SGP, Leichnetz GR. Cortical projections to the periaqueductal gray in the monkey: a retrograde and orthograde horseradish peroxidase study. Neurosci Lett 1981; 22: 97–101.

Hare RD. Electrodermal and cardiovascular correlates of psychopathy. In: Hare RD, Schalling D, editors. Psychopathic behaviour: approaches to research. Chichester: John Wiley, 1978: 107–43. 302 O. Devinsky et al.

Hassler R, Dieckmann G. Traitement stéréotaxique des tics et cris inarticulés ou copralalique considérés comme phénomène d'obsession motrice au cours de la maladies de Gilles de la Tourette. Rev Neurol (Paris) 1970; 123: 89–100.

Heilman KM, Valenstein E. Frontal lobe neglect in man. Neurology 1972; 22: 660-4.

Holstege G. The emotional motor system. [Review]. Eur J Morphol 1992; 30: 67-79.

Horsely VA, Schäfer EA. A record of experiments upon the functions of the cerebral cortex. Phil Trans Lond 1888; 179B: 1–45.

Hurley KM, Herbert H, Moga MM, Saper CB. Efferent projections of the infralimbic cortex of the rat. J Comp Neurol 1991; 308: 249–76.

Hurley-Gius KM, Neafsey EJ. The medial frontal cortex and gastric motility: Microstimulation results and their possible significance for the overall pattern of organization of rat frontal and parietal cortex. Brain Res 1986; 365: 241–8.

Ironside R, Guttmacher M. The corpus callosum and its tumours. Brain 1929; 52: 442–83.

Jarvie HF. Frontal lobe wounds causing disinhibition. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 1954; 17: 14-32.

Jimeno AL, Paniagua JL. The gyrus cinguli and aggressivity. [Spanish]. Actas Luso Esp Neurol Psiquiatr 1969; 28: 289–98.

Jones AKP, Brown WD, Friston KJ, Qi LY, Frackowiak RSJ. Cortical and subcortical localization of response to pain in man using positron emission tomography. Proc R Soc Lond Biol 1991a; 244: 39-44.

Jones AKP, Friston KJ, Qi LY, Harris M, Cunningham VJ, Jones T, et al. Sites of action of morphine in the brain. [Letter]. Lancet 1991b; 338: 825.

Jürgens U, Ploog D. Cerebral representation of vocalization in the squirrel monkey. [Letter]. Exp Brain Res 1970; 10: 532-54.

Jürgens U, Pratt R. Role of the periaqueductal gray in vocal expression of emotion. Brain Res 1979; 167: 367–78.

Kaada BR. Somato-motor, autonomic and electrocorticographic responses to electrical stimulation of 'rhinencephalic' and other structures in primates, cat and dog. Acta Physiol Scand 1951; 24 Suppl 83: 1–285.

Kaada BR, Pribram KH, Epstein JA. Respiratory and vascular responses in monkeys from temporal pole, insula, orbital surface and cingulate gyrus. J Neurophysiol 1949; 12: 347–56.

Kawasaki Y, Maeda Y, Suzuki M, Urata K, Higashima M, Kima K, et al. SPECT analysis of regional cerebral blood flow changes in patients with schizophrenia during the Wisconsin Card Sorting Test. Schizophr Res 1993; 10: 109–16.

Kemper TL, Romanul FCA. State resembling akinetic mutism in basilar artery occlusion. Neurology 1967; 17: 74–80.

Kennard MA. The cingulate gyrus in relation to consciousness. J Nerv Ment Dis 1955; 121: 34–9.

Ketter TA, Andreason PJ, George MS, et al. Limbic mediation of procaine-induced emotional and psychosensory experiences in man. Arch Gen Psychiatry 1994. In press.

Kunishio K, Haber SN. Primate cingulostriatal projection: limbic striatal versus sensorimotor striatal input. J Comp Neurol 1994; 350: 337-56.

Kurlan R, Behr J, Medved L, Como P. Transient tic disorder and the spectrum of Tourette's syndrome. Arch Neurol 1988; 45: 1200-1.

Laitinen LV, Vilkki J. Observations on the transcallosal emotional connections. In: Laitinen LV, Livingston KE, editors. Surgical approaches in psychiatry. Lancaster (UK): MTP, 1973: 74–80.

Laplane D, Talairach J, Meininger V, Bancaud J, Orgogozo JM. Clinical consequences of corticectomies involving the supplementary motor area in man. J Neurol Sci 1977; 34: 301–14.

Laplane D, Degos JD, Baulac M, Gray F. Bilateral infarction of the anterior cingulate gyri and of the fornices. J Neurol Sci 1981; 51: 289–300.

Larsson K. Mating behavior in male rats after cerebral cortex ablation. II. Effects of lesions in the frontal lobes compared to lesions in the posterior half of the hemispheres. J Exp Zool 1964; 155: 203–13.

Le Beau J. Anterior cingulectomy in man. J Neurosurg 1954; 11: 268–76.

Le Beau J, Pecker J. Etudes de certaines formes d'agitation psychomotrice au cours de l'épilepsie et de l'arriération mentale, traitées par la topectomie péri-calleuse antérieure bilatérale. Semaine Hôp Paris 1950; 26: 1536–51.

Ledesma JA, Paniagua JL. Circunvolucion del cingulo y agresividad. Actas Luso Esp Neurol Psiquiatr 1969; 28: 289–98.

LeDoux JE. Emotion and the limbic system concept. Concepts Neurosci 1991; 2: 169–99.

Levin B, Duchowny M. Childhood obsessive-compulsive disorder and cingulate epilepsy. Biol Psychiatry 1991; 30: 1049–55.

Lewin W. Observations on selective leucotomy. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 1961; 24: 37–44.

Lewin W, Whitty CWM. Effects of anterior cingulate stimulation in conscious human subjects. J Neurophysiol 1960; 23: 445–7.

Long CJ, Pueschel K, Hunter SE. Assessment of the effects of cingulate gyrus lesions by neuropsychological techniques. J Neurosurg 1978; 49: 264–71.

Lubar JF, Herrmann TF, Moore DR, Shouse MN. Effect of septal and frontal ablations on species-typical behavior in the rat. J Comp Physiol Psychol 1973; 83: 260–70.

Luppino G, Matelli M, Camarda RM, Gallese V, Rizzolatti G. Multiple representations of body movements in mesiał area 6 and the adjacent cingulate cortex: an intracortical microstimulation study in the macaque monkey. J Comp Neurol 1991; 311: 463–82.

MacLean PD. The triune brain in evolution: role in paleocerebral functions. New York: Plenum Press, 1990.

MacLean PD. Perspectives on cingulate cortex in the limbic system. In: Vogt BA, Gabriel M, editors. Neurobiology of Cingulate Cortex and Limbic Thalamus, Boston: Birkhauser, 1993.

MacLean PD, Newman JD. Role of midline frontolimbic cortex in production of the isolation call of squirrel monkeys. Brain Res 1988; 450: 111-23.

Malamud N. Psychiatric disorder with intracranial tumors of limbic system. Arch Neurol 1967; 17: 113–23.

Marino R Jr. The anterior cerebral artery: I. Anatomo-radiological study of its cortical territories. Surg Neurol 1976; 5: 81–7.

Masdeu JC, Schoene WC, Funkenstein HH. Aphasia following infarction of the left supplementary motor area. Neurology 1978; 28: 1220–3.

Mazars G. Criteria for identifying cingulate epilepsies. Epilepsia 1970; 11: 41-7.

McCleary RA. Response specificity in the behavioral effects of limbic system lesions in the cat. J Comp Physiol Psychol 1961; 54: 605–13.

Meador KJ, Watson RT, Bowers D, Heilman KM. Hypometria with hemispatial and limb motor neglect. Brain 1986; 109: 293–305.

Mettler FA. Anatomy and physiology. In: Mettler FA, editor. Selective partial ablation of the frontal cortex. New York: Hoeber, 1949: 477–91.

Meyer G, McElhaney M, Martin W, McGraw CP. Stereotactic cingulotomy with results of acute stimulation and serial psychological testing. In: Laitinen LV, Livingston KE, editors. Surgical approaches in psychiatry. Lancaster (UK): MTP, Baltimore, 1973: 39–58.

Meyers RE. Neurology of social behavior and affect in primates: a study of prefrontal and anterior temporal cortex. In: cerebral localization. Zülch KJ, Creutzfeldt O, Galbraith GC, editors. Berlin: Springer-Verlag, 1975: 161–70.

Morecraft RJ, Van Hoesen GW. Cingulate input to the primary and supplementary motor cortices in the rhesus monkey: evidence for somatotopy in areas 24c and 23c. J Comp Neurol 1992; 322: 471–89.

Morecraft RJ, Geula C, Mesulam MM. Cytoarchitecture and neural afferents of orbitofrontal cortex in the brain of the monkey. J Comp Neurol 1992; 323: 341–58.

Müller-Preuss P, Jürgens U. Projections from the 'cingular' vocalization area in the squirrel monkey. Brain Res 1976; 103: 29–43.

Neafsey EJ. Prefrontal cortical control of the autonomic nervous system: anatomical and physiological observations. [Review]. Prog Brain Res 1990; 85; 147–66.

Neafsey EJ, Terreberry RR, Hurley KM, Ruit KG, Frysztak RJ. Anterior cingulate cortex in rodents: connections, visceral control functions, and implications of emotion. In: Vogt BA, Gabriel M, editors. Neurobiology of cingulate cortex and limbic thalamus: a comprehensive handbook. Boston: Birkhäuser, 1993; 206–23.

Nee LE, Caine ED, Polinsky RJ, Eldridge R, Ebert MH. Gilles de la Tourette syndrome: clinical and family study of 50 cases. Ann Neurol 1980; 7: 41–9.

Nemeth G, Hegedus K, Molnar L. Akinetic mutism associated with bicingular lesions: clinicopathological and functional anatomical correlates. Eur Arch Psychiatry Neurol Sci 1988; 237: 218–22.

Obeso JA, Rothwell JC, Marsden CD. Simple tics in Gilles de la Tourette's syndrome are not prefaced by a normal premovement EEG potential. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 1981; 44: 735–8.

Olds J, Milner PM. Positive reinforcement produced by electrical

stimulation of spetal area and other regions of rat brain. J Comp Physiol Psychol 1954; 47: 419-27.

Olds ME, Olds J. Approach-avoidance analysis of rat diencephalon. J Comp Neurol 1963; 120: 259–95.

Olson CR, Musil SY, Goldberg ME. Posterior cingulate cortex and visuospatial cognition: Properties of single neurons in the behaving monkey. In: Vogt BA, Gabriel M (eds), Neurobiology of Cingulate Cortex and Limbic Thalamus. Boston: Birkhäuser, 1993.

Ono M, Kubik S, Abernathey CD. Atlas of the Cerebral Sulci, Georg Thieme Verlag, New York, 1990.

Orgogozo JM, Larsen B. Activation of the supplementary motor area during voluntary movement in man suggests it works as a supramotor area. Science 1979; 206: 847–50.

Pandya DN, Van Hoesen GW, Mesulam MM. Efferent connections of the cingulate gyrus in the rhesus monkey. Exp Brain Res 1981; 42: 319–30.

Pardo JV, Pardo PJ, Janer KW, Raichle ME. The anterior cingulate cortex mediates processing selection in the Stroop attentional conflict paradigm. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 1990; 87: 256–9.

Pauls DL, Leckman JF. The inheritance of Gilles de la Tourette's syndrome and associated behaviors. N Engl J Med 1986; 315: 993–7.

Pechtel C, McAvoy T, Levitt M, Kling A, Masserman JH. The cingulates and behavior. J Nerv Ment Dis 1958; 126: 148-52.

Penfield W, Jasper H. Epilepsy and the functional anatomy of the human brain. Boston: Little Brown: 1954.

Peretz E. The effects of lesions of the anterior cingulate cortex on the behavior of the rat. J Comp Physiol Psychol 1960; 53: 540–8.

Perlmutter D, Rhoton AL Jr. Microsurgical anatomy of the distal anterior cerebral artery. J Neurosurg. 1978; 49: 204–28.

Petersen SE, Fox PT, Posner MI, Mintun M, Raichle ME. Positron emission tomographic studies of the cortical anatomy of single-word processing. Nature 1988; 331: 585–9.

Petersen SE, Fox PT, Snyder AZ, Raichle ME. Activation of extrastriate and frontal cortical areas by visual words and word-like stimuli. Science 1990; 249: 1041–44.

Petit L, Orssaud C, Tzourio N, Salamon G, Mazoyer B, Berthoz A. PET study of voluntary saccadic eye movements in humans: basal ganglia-thalamocortical system and cingulate cortex involvement. J Neurophysiol 1993; 69: 1009–17.

Poeck K. Pathophysiology of emotional disorders associated with brain damage. In: Vinken PJ, Bruyn GW, editors. Handbook of clinical neurology, Vol. 3. Amsterdam: North-Holland, 1969; 343-67.

Pool JL. The visceral brain of man. J Neurosurg 1954; 11: 45-63.

Pool JL, Ransohoff J. Autonomic effects on stimulating rostral portion of cingulate gyri in man. J Neurophysiol 1949; 12: 385-92.

Pool KD, Devous MD Sr, Freeman FJ, Watson BC, Finitzo T. Regional cerebral blood flow in developmental stutterers [see comments]. Arch Neurol 1991; 48: 509–12. Comment in: Arch Neurol 1992; 49: 346–8, comment in: Arch Neurol 1993; 50: 1287–90. 304 O. Devinsky et al.

Porrino LJ. Cortical mechanisms of reinforcement. In: Vogt BA, Gabriel M, editors. Neurobiology of cingulate cortex and limbic thalamus: a comprehensive handbook. Boston: Birkhäuser, 1993; 445–60.

Posner MI, Petersen SE. The attention system of the human brain. [Review]. Ann Rev Neurosci 1990; 13: 25–42.

Posner MI, Petersen SE, Fox PT, Raichle ME. Localization of cognitive operations in the human brain. [Review]. Science 1988; 240: 1627–31.

Pribram KH, Fulton JF. An experimental critique of the effects of anterior cingulate ablations in monkey. Brain 1954; 77: 34–44.

Pribram KH, Kruger L. Functions of the 'olfactory brain.' Ann NY Acad Sci 1954; 58: 109–38.

Quesney LF. Seizures of frontal lobe origin. In: Pedley TA, Meldrum BS, editors. Recent advances in epilepsy, No. 3 Edinburgh: Churchill Livingstone, 1986; 3: 81–110.

Quesney LF, Constain M, Rasmussen T, Olivier A, Palmini A. Presurgical EEG investigation of frontal lobe epilepsy. In: Theodore WH, editor. Surgical treatment of epilepsy. Amsterdam: Elsevier, 1992; 55–69.

Raichle ME, Fiez JA, Videen TO, MacLeod A-M K, Pardo JV, Fox PT, et al. Practice-related changes in human brain functional anatomy during nonmotor learning. Cereb Cortex 1994; 4: 8–26.

Ralston BL. Cingulate epilepsy and secondary bilateral synchrony. Electroencephalogr Clin Neurophysiol 1961; 13: 591–8.

Rauch SL, Jeinke MA, Alpert NM, Baer L, Breiter HC, Savage CR, et al. Regional cerebral blood flow measured during symptom provocation in obsessive-compulsive disorder using oxygen 15-labeled carbon dioxide and positron emission tomography. Arch Gen Psychiatry 1994; 51: 62–70.

Robertson A, Laferriere A, Franklin KBJ. Amphetamine and increases in current intensity modulate reward in the hypothalamus and substantia nigra but not in the prefrontal cortex. Physiol Behav 1981; 26: 809–13.

Robertson A, Laferriere A, Milner PM. Treatment with anticonvulsant drugs retards the development of brain-stimulation reward in the prefrontal cortex. Physiol Behav 1982; 29: 275–80.

Robertson M, Doran M, Trimble M, Lees AJ. The treatment of Gilles de la Tourette syndrome by limbic leucotomy. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 1990; 53: 691–4.

Robinson BW. Vocalization evoked from forebrain stimulation in Macaca mulatta. Physiol Behav 1967; 2: 345-54.

Robinson BW, Mishkin M. Alimentary responses to forebrain stimulation in monkeys. Exp Brain Res 1968; 4: 330-66.

Roland PE, Larsen B, Lassen NA, Skinhoj E. Supplementary motor area and other cortical areas in organization of voluntary movements in man. J Neurophysiol 1980; 43: 118–36.

Room P, Russchen FT, Groenewegen HJ, Lohman AHM. Efferent connections of the prelimbic (area 32) and the infralimbic (area 25) cortices: an anterograde tracing study in the cat. J Comp Neurol 1985, 242: 40–55.

Ross ED, Stewart RM. Akinetic mutism from hypothalamic damage:

successful treatment with dopamine agonists. Neurology 1981; 31: 1435–9.

Rubens AB, Kertesz A. Localization of lesions in transcortical aphasias, In: Kertesz A, editor. Localization in neuropsychology. New York: Academic Press, 1983: 45–68.

Russchen FT, Bakst I, Amaral DG, Price JL. The amygdalostriatal projections in the monkey. An anterograde tracing study. Brain Res 1985; 329: 241–57.

Saint-Hilaire JM, Neilleux F, Giard M, Bernier G, Rouleau O, Bouvier G, et al. Frontal lobe epileptic manifestations studied with depth electrodes [abstract]. Epilepsia 1988; 29: 207–8.

Sammaritano MR, Adam C, Giard N, Saint-Hilaire JM. Frontal lobe origin of gelastic seizures studied with SEEG [abstract]. Epilepsia 1993; 34 (Suppl 6): 132.

Schlag-Rey M, Schlag J. Visuomotor functions of central thalamus in monkey. I. Unit activity related to spontaneous eye movements. J Neurophysiol 1984; 51: 1149–74.

Schlaug G, Knorr U, Seitz RJ. Inter-subject variability of cerebral activations in acquiring a motor skill: a study with positron emission tomography. Exp Brain Res 1994; 98: 523–34.

Schultz W, Apicella P, Scarnati E, Ljungberg T. Neuronal activity in monkey ventral striatum related to the expectation of reward. J Neurosci 1992; 12: 4595–610.

Scoville WB. Selective cortical undercutting as a means of modifying and studying frontal lobe function in man. Preliminary report of forty-three operative cases. J Neurosurg 1949; 6: 65–73.

Setekleiv J. Uterine motility of the estrogenized rabbit. V. Response to brain stimulation. Acta Physiol Scand 1964; 62: 313–22.

Shima K, Aya K, Mushiake H, Inase M, Aizawa H, Tanji J. Two movement-related foci in the primate cingulate cortex observed in signal-triggered and self-paced forelimb movements. J Neurophysiol 1991; 65: 188–202.

Siegel A, Brutus M. Neural substrates of aggression and rage in the cat. Prog Psychobiol Physiol Psychol 1990; 14: 135–233.

Sikes RW, Vogt BA. Nociceptive neurons in area 24 of rabbit cingulate cortex. J Neurophysiol 1992; 68: 1720–32.

Sikes RW, Vogt BA, Swadlow HA. Neuronal responses in rabbit cingulate cortex linked to quick-phase eye movements during nystagmus. J Neurophysiol 1988; 59: 922–36.

Singer HS, Butler IJ, Tune LE, Seifert WE Jr, Coyle JT. Dopaminergic dysfunction in Tourette syndrome. Ann Neurol 1982; 12: 361–6.

Skultety FM. Clinical and experimental aspects of akinetic mutism. Arch Neurol 1968; 19: 1–14.

Smith WK. The results of ablation of the cingular region of the cerebral cortex. Fed Proc 1944; 3: 42–3.

Smith WK. The functional significance of the rostral cingular cortex as revealed by its responses to electrical excitation. J Neurophysiol 1945; 8: 241–55.

Smith OA, Nathan MA. The development of cardiac and blood flow conditioned responses during the acquisition of a differentiated 'conditioned emotional response' in monkeys. Cond Reflex 1967; 2: 155-6.

Squires RF, Lajtha A, Saederup E, Palkovits M. Reduced [3H]flunitrazepam binding in cingulate cortex and hippocampus of postmortem schizophrenic brains: is selective loss of glutamatergic neurons associated with major psychoses? Neurochem Res 1993; 18: 219–23.

Stanton GB, Bruce CJ, Goldberg ME. Topography of projections to the frontal lobe from the macaque frontal eye fields. J Comp Neurol 1993; 330: 286–301.

Stoffels C, Munari C, Brunie-Lozano E, Bonis A, Bancaud J, Talairach J. Manifestations automatiques dans les crises épileptiques partielles complexes d'origine frontale. Progressi in Epilettologia, Bulletino Lega Italia, Epilettologia 1980; 29–30: 111–13.

Stoffels C, Munari C, Bossi L, Brunie-Lozano E, Bonis A, Bancaud J, et al. Seizures of the anterior cingular gyrus in man: a stereo-EEG study. Epilepsy, International Symposium, Kyoto, 1981; 85–6.

Sutton D, Larson C, Lindeman RC. Neocortical and limbic lesion effects on primate phonation. Brain Res 1974; 71: 61-75.

Swartz BE. Electrophysiology of bimanual-bipedal automatisms. Epilepsia 1994; 35: 264–74.

Talairach J, Bancaud J, Geier S, Bordas-Ferrer M, Bonis A, Szikla G, et al. The cingulate gyrus and human behaviour. Electroencephalogr Clin Neurophysiol 1973; 34: 45–52.

Talbot JD, Marrett S, Evans AC, Meyer E, Bushnell MC, Duncan GH. Multiple representations of pain in human cerebral cortex [see comments]. Science 1991; 251: 1355–8. Comment in: Science 1992; 255: 215–16.

Tamminga CA, Thaker GK, Buchanan R, Kirkpatrick B, Alphs LD, Chase TN, et al. Limbic system abnormalities identified in schizophrenia using positron emission tomography with fluorodeoxyglucose and neocortical alterations with deficit syndrome. Arch Gen Psychiatry 1992; 49: 522–30.

Terreberry RR, Neafsey EJ. Rat medial frontal cortex: a visceral motor region with a direct projection to the solitary nucleus. Brain Res. 1983; 278: 245–9.

Theodore WH, Porter RJ, Penry JK. Complex partial seizures: clinical characteristics and differential diagnosis. Neurology 1983; 33: 1115-21.

Tow PM, Whitty CWM. Personality changes after operations of the cingulate gyrus in man. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 1953; 16: 186–93.

Tükel K, Jasper H. The electroencephalogram in parasagittal lesions. Electroencephalogr Clin Neurophysiol 1952; 4: 481–94.

Ungerstedt U. Stereotaxic mapping of the monoamine pathways in the rat brain. Acta Physiol Scand Suppl 1971; Suppl 367: 1–48.

US Department of Health, Education and Welfare. The National Commission for the Protection of Human Subjects of Biomedical and Behavioral Research. Report and Recommendations: Psychosurgery. Report No: (OS)77–0001. Washington (DC), 1977.

Vaccarino AL, Melzack R. Analgesia produced by injection of lidocaine into the anterior cingulum bundle of the rat. Pain 1989; 39: 213–19.

Valenstein E, Bowers D, Verfaellie M, Heilman KM, Day A, Watson RT. Retrosplenial amnesia. Brain 1987; 110: 1631–46.

Van Buren JM, Fedio P. Functional representation on the medial aspect of the frontal lobes in man. J Neurosurg 1976; 44: 275-89.

Van Hoesen GW, Morecraft RJ, Vogt BA. Connections of the monkey cingulate cortex. In: Vogt BA, Gabriel M, editors. Neurobiology of cingulate cortex and limbic thalamus: a comprehensive handbook. Boston: Birkhäuser, 1993: 249–84.

Verfaellie M, Heilman KM. Response preparation and response inhibition after lesions of the medial frontal lobe. Arch Neurol 1987; 44: 1265–71.

Vogt BA. Structural organization of cingulate cortex: areas, neurons, and somatodendritic receptors. In: Vogt BA and Gabriel M, editors. Neurobiology of cingulate cortex and limbic thalamus: a comprehensive handbook, Boston: Birkhäuser, 1993: 19–70.

Vogt BA, Barbas H. Structure and connections of the cingulate vocalization region in the rhesus monkey. In: Newman JD, editor. The physiological control of mammalian vocalization. New York: Plenum Press, 1988: 203–25.

Vogt BA, Pandya DN. Cingulate cortex of the rhesus monkey: II. Cortical afferents. J Comp Neurol 1987; 262: 271-89.

Vogt BA, Rosene DL, Pandya DN. Thalamic and cortical afferents differentiate anterior from posterior cingulate cortex in the monkey. Science 1979; 204: 205–7.

Vogt BA, Pandya DN, Rosene DL. Cingulate cortex of the rhesus monkey: I. Cytoarchitecture and thalamic afferents. J Comp Neurol 1987; 262: 256–70.

Vogt BA, Finch DM, Olson CR. Functional heterogeneity in cingulate cortex: the anterior executive and posterior evaluative regions. [Review]. Cerebral Cortex 1992a; 2: 435–43.

Vogt LJ, Vogt BA, Sikes RW. The limbic thalamus in rabbit: architecture, projections to cingulate cortex and distribution of muscarinic acetylcholine, GABA-A, and opiod receptors. J Comp Neurol 1992b; 319: 205–17.

Vogt BA, Nimchinsky EA, Vogt LJ, Hof PR. Human cingulate cortex: surface features, flat maps, and cytoarchitecture. J Comp Neurol 1995. In press.

Vonderahe AR. Anatomic basis of emotion. Ohio State Med J 1943; 39: 325-30.

Ward AA. The cingular gyrus: area 24. J Neurophysiol 1948a; 11: 13–23.

Ward AA. The anterior cingulate gyrus and personality. Res Publ Assoc Nerv Ment Dis 1948b; 27: 438–45.

Watson RT, Heilman KM, Cauthen JC, King FA. Neglect after cingulectomy. Neurology 1973; 23: 1003–7.

Watson RT, Miller BD, Heilman KM. Nonsensory neglect. Ann Neurol 1978; 3: 505-8.

Whitty CWM, Duffield JE, Tow PM, Cairns H. Anterior cingulectomy in the treatment of mental disease. Lancet 1952; 1: 475–81.

Willett CJ, Gwyn DG, Rutherford JG, Leslie RA. Cortical projections

306 O. Devinsky et al.

to the nucleus of the tractus solitarius: an HRP study in the cat. Brain Res Bull 1986; 16: 497-505.

Wilson DH, Chang AE. Bilateral anterior cingulectomy for the relief of intractable pain (report of 28 patients). Confin Neurol 1974; 36: 61-8.

Yeterian EH, Van Hoesen GW. Cortico-striate projections in the rhesus monkey: the organization of certain cortico-caudate connections. Brain Res 1978; 139: 43–63.

Received July 8, 1994. Revised September 22, 1994. Accepted October 6, 1994